



Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales

Cofnod y Trafodion The Record of Proceedings

[Y Pwyllgor Craffu ar Waith y Prif Weinidog](#)

[Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister](#)

27/10/2017

[Agenda'r Cyfarfod](#)

[Meeting Agenda](#)

[Trawsgrifiadau'r Pwyllgor](#)

[Committee Transcripts](#)

Cynnwys Contents

- 4 Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau
Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest
- 5 Sesiwn Graffu ar waith y Gweinidog—Hawliau Plant a Phobl Ifanc
Ministerial Scrutiny Session—The Rights of Children and Young People
- 48 Sesiwn i Graffu ar Waith y Gweinidog—Materion Amserol Ministerial
Scrutiny Session—Topical Matters
- 58 Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd
o'r Cyfarfod
Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public
from the Meeting

Cofnodir y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd. Lle y mae cyfranwyr wedi darparu cywiriadau i'w tystiolaeth, nodir y rheini yn y trawsgrifiad.

The proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included. Where contributors have supplied corrections to their evidence, these are noted in the transcript.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

John Griffiths Bywgraffiad Biography	Llafur Labour
Huw Irranca-Davies Bywgraffiad Biography	Llafur Labour
Ann Jones Bywgraffiad Biography	Llafur (Y Dirprwy Lywydd a Chadeirydd y Pwyllgor) Labour (The Deputy Presiding Officer and Committee Chair)
Dai Lloyd Bywgraffiad Biography	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Lynne Neagle Bywgraffiad Biography	Llafur Labour
Nick Ramsay Bywgraffiad Biography	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
David Rees Bywgraffiad Biography	Llafur Labour
David J. Rowlands Bywgraffiad Biography	UKIP Cymru UKIP Wales

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

Karen Cornish	Dirprwy Gyfarwyddwr, Plant a Theuluoedd, Llywodraeth Cymru Deputy Director, Children and Families, Welsh Government
Carwyn Jones Bywgraffiad Biography	Aelod Cynulliad, Llafur (Y Prif Weinidog) Assembly Member, Labour (The First Minister)

Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance

Graeme Francis Clerc
 Clerc

Kath Thomas Dirprwy Clerc
 Deputy Clerk

*Cynhaliwyd y cyfarfod yng Nghanolfan Cwmbrân ar gyfer Pobl Ifanc.
The meeting was held in the Cwmbran Centre for Young People.*

*Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 10:00
The meeting began 10:00.*

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest

[1] **Ann Jones:** Good morning. I have to say that that silence, then, was great, so I hope Assembly Members can take note from how you have responded to the fact that we're about to start, so thanks very much. In opening this scrutiny of the First Minister, can I first of all welcome everybody to the centre, welcome all the young people who we've had an opportunity to talk to, and thank the centre and the staff for the hospitality in hosting us today? I think, so far, it's been very successful. I hope you'll find it is successful at the end of the session. I want to welcome the First Minister, Carwyn Jones, and his official, and thank them for coming, because without you I suppose we wouldn't have a committee meeting, because it is scrutiny of the First Minister. So, First Minister, could I ask you to introduce yourself and your official for the record?

[2] **The First Minister (Carwyn Jones):** Yes, Carwyn Jones, First Minister; and Karen Cornish. Karen is the deputy director in the children and families division.

[3] **Ann Jones:** Okay, thanks very much. We've had a number of apologies, so we are a smaller committee than usual. We've had apologies from Jayne Bryant, Russell George, Mike Hedges, Bethan Jenkins and Simon Thomas. I've just got a couple of housekeeping—. I've made sure that Members around the table have turned their phones off. Could I ask members of the audience if you could just put your phones off? I think it affects the broadcasting and the translation equipment, so if you could just put them off that would be

really good. And I need to tell you that if there is a fire or if a fire alarm operates, or there's some sort of fire, there's an exit behind the First Minister and an exit behind me here, so then we'll go outside and then we'll wait for further instructions from the staff here.

[4] Our formal session for the scrutiny of the First Minister splits into two parts. So, the first part of this will be item 2, which is the main item, which is covering the Welsh Government's approach to protecting and promoting the rights of children and young people. There's a series of questions that we will ask the First Minister, and then we'll move to the second item on the agenda, which will be topical questions that Members will be able to ask the First Minister about.

10:02

Sesiwn Graffu ar waith y Gweinidog—Hawliau Plant a Phobl Ifanc Ministerial Scrutiny Session—The Rights of Children and Young People

[5] **Ann Jones:** So, I think, without any further ado, then, we're going to move into the main item, which is, as I say, scrutiny of the Welsh Government's approach to protecting and promoting the rights of children and young people. And so, just to give you some sort of idea, we're going to break this section into three. We've got three main themes, so it's the Rights of Children and Young Persons (Wales) Measure 2011 and the incorporation of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child in Wales. Then, the second part of this will be progress in implementing the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child in Wales. And then the third part is the programme for government as relevant to children and young people. So, those are the three areas and we'll try and keep to those three areas, but we do find, sometimes, the way the questioning goes, that we stray into all sorts of different areas, so we will try and do that.

[6] This is being recorded so it will go up onto Senedd.tv later, so you can all have a look at it. You might find yourselves on it. I think we get quite used to it. It is being recorded, so there is a record of it, and then there is a record that we will send to the First Minister to check for accuracy at the end of the meeting, and then we'll publish that as a formal record of this session.

[7] So, I think I've said enough now. I'm going to move to the first section, which is the Rights of Children and Young Persons (Wales) Measure and the incorporation of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the

Child in Wales. Nick, you've got the first question on the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015. Do you want to start?

[8] **Nick Ramsay:** Thank you, Chair. Morning, First Minister. It's a pretty general question, really, but sitting on the Finance Committee as I do and chairing the Public Accounts Committee, the issue of the future generations Act comes up repeatedly in different contexts. We keep coming back to the issue that it's a great idea in principle, and only a few months ago Lord Willetts—David Willetts, former Minister in the UK Government—came to the Assembly and I was talking to him about the future generations Act. He was very impressed. He thought the Assembly was very forward looking in trying to develop that. But consistently we have to ask the question, 'How is it actually working out in practice?' The jury seems to be out yet as to whether something so ambitious as a future generations Bill can ultimately work in the long term, and, indeed, whether or not it's factored into the budget-setting process at this time of year in the Assembly. Because if that's not happening and it's not being mainstreamed across all departments, then will it ultimately deliver what you as a Government would like to see happen?

[9] **The First Minister:** Well, it's early days yet, but the Act itself is designed, of course, to operate not just across the Government, but across all public bodies. It goes more widely than that. It provides a governance framework for public bodies to improve how they serve the interests of all people, including, of course, children and young people. One of the things that the Act does is to support the commitments that have been made for children, such as the UNCRC. It provides for better decision making by public bodies. It gives them a context within which they're able to operate. The Act, of course, is intended to have a positive impact on the lives of children. I was actually with a group of farmers on Tuesday, who were enthusing about the future generations Act and saying how it was important for them. They understood that the well-being of future generations involved sustainability in all its forms—economic, social and environmental sustainability. So, what started as an idea that needed to be developed into something more tangible, I think, has made very good progress, and we'll see the influence of the Act more and more over the next few years.

[10] **Ann Jones:** Yes, briefly.

[11] **Nick Ramsay:** Very briefly, yes, because it's an appropriate time to raise future generations because we've got the future generations behind us today. Thank you for your answer, but you didn't mention there about the

budget-setting process at this point. How are you actually making sure that, when it comes to allocating the budgets for the different portfolios, that Act is first and foremost in people's minds?

[12] **The First Minister:** It weaves through everything we do as a Government. If we can't think of the future generations and the impact that the budget makes on the future generations, then we're not keeping to the letter and the spirit of the Act. So, it is something that all Ministers are aware of. It's a cross-Government approach, and it is something that very much influences the way that we work through the budget process during the course of the year.

[13] **Ann Jones:** Thank you. I'm going to go to Lynne Neagle now to do the first general questions around the rights information, and then I'll fetch you all in.

[14] **John Griffiths:** Before we do, Chair, I wonder if I could just carry on with the theme of the practical application, as Nick mentioned, because I'm just interested in the public services boards. It seems to me that they're in a prime position in terms of the Act actually meaning something on the ground. They're doing their well-being plans, their assessments of the needs of the local population and so on, and that's going to give practical application to the legislation. So, I'm just wondering, First Minister, to what extent Welsh Government is keeping a watching brief on the public services boards and those well-being strategies, particularly in terms of children's rights and children's needs.

[15] **The First Minister:** Well, we don't monitor, as a Government, what they do because these are legal responsibilities—legal duties—that they have, and they're answerable in other ways for that. They must take responsibility for their own implementation of the Act. There is statutory guidance, however, that's issued under the Act. It's called 'Shared Purpose: Shared Future'. It includes the participation of children and young people, and those public bodies that are subject to the provisions of the Act have to take that guidance into account. So, there is responsibility and there is accountability, but that accountability, of course, lies in terms of those public bodies complying with the law.

[16] **Ann Jones:** Thanks. I'm going to move now. There are some general questions I think Lynne's got around the Rights of Children and Young Persons (Wales) Measure 2011.

[17] **Lynne Neagle:** Thanks, Chair. Six years ago, when the rights of children and young people Measure was introduced, Wales was considered to be leading the world on children's rights. Can you just tell us what difference you think the Measure has made to children and young people in Wales?

[18] **The First Minister:** Well, I think, more than anything else, it's led to the rights of children and young people being mainstreamed into the work of Government. If we look at children's rights impact assessments, they're something, of course, that form a significant part of Government decision making now. We also know, of course, with the due regard responsibility that Ministers have, that the UNCRC is now very much part of our decision making and very much part of the law in Wales in that sense. So, it has put children and young people's rights at the forefront of our decision making in a way that wasn't there before.

[19] **Lynne Neagle:** So, are you able to give us some examples of the things that have actually changed as a result of the Measure for children in Wales?

[20] **The First Minister:** I think, more than anything else, we are seeing that the—. We are looking at children and young people's rights, and it is part of the decision-making process of Government. Every single submission that comes up to me and other Ministers has to be examined in the context of what it means for children and young persons' rights. There is a template that officials have to use, so there's a recognised process that is taken through, and that means, of course, that it is a formal part of the decision-making process in a way that wasn't there before.

[21] **Lynne Neagle:** You mentioned the process of children's rights impact assessments. I'm sure you'll be aware that the Children, Young People and Education Committee has some concerns about the robustness of that process, and also how transparent it is. And when we had the Cabinet Secretary for Communities and Children before us, he was only able to provide one example of things that had changed as a result of the CRIA process, and that was some time ago. Are you able to give us some concrete examples of how this CRIA process has actually made a difference for young people?

[22] **The First Minister:** In terms of the duty that's placed on Ministers, it's difficult to give discrete examples, but, in general terms, if we look at decisions that we take then the CRIAs are a fundamental part of all those

decisions. If we look, for example, at the way that we structure schemes to deal with children and child poverty then, inevitably, the CRIAs are a hugely important part of that process. It's woven all the way through the work of Government.

[23] **Lynne Neagle:** Okay. Can I just ask one other question? You'll also be aware that the committee was very keen to have children's rights on the face of the Additional Learning Needs and Education Tribunal (Wales) Bill. That was initially resisted by Welsh Government, but there has been some very welcome movement now, and we're looking to find a way of placing that on the face of the Bill. What consideration have you given to ensuring that children's rights are fully incorporated into all our legislation in Wales?

[24] **The First Minister:** The due regard requirement is already there for Ministers. Under the Measure, of course, we have to produce a children's rights scheme and we have to report on how Welsh Ministers have complied with the due regard duty. Welsh Ministers have to promote an understanding and knowledge of the UNCRC amongst the public as well, including children. As far as the ALN Bill is concerned, what we are keen to do is to incorporate as much as we can without creating an onerous burden on professionals. One of the suggestions that's been made to me is that individuals should be subject to the UNCRC duties and account for the way in which they work as professionals. We think that's too onerous. But in terms of extending the duty perhaps to other bodies, in terms of bodies being required to produce schemes as to how they operate and how they comply with the UNCRC, I think there is a conversation to be had about that.

[25] **Ann Jones:** Okay. Dai.

[26] **Dai Lloyd:** Diolch yn fawr, Gadeirydd. Ymhellach i gwestiynau Lynne, mae gyda ni'r Mesur hawliau plant a phobl ifanc yma a hefyd y Ddeddf Llesiant cenedlaethau'r dyfodol, ond mae pobl wastad yn gofyn pa wahaniaeth mae'r gwahanol Ddeddfau yma yn eu gwneud ar y llawr. Rydym wedi cael trafodaeth y bore yma efo pobl ifanc Ysgol Gyfun Gwynllyw yn fan hyn, ac un o'r cwestiynau oedd yn codi oedd

Dai Lloyd: Thank you very much, Chair. Further to Lynne's questions, we have the children and young people's rights Measure and also the well-being of future generations Act, but people always ask what difference these different Acts make at the grass-roots level. We've had a discussion this morning with young people from Ysgol Gyfun Gwynllyw here, and one of the questions that arose was mental health services for

gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i blant a phobl ifanc, neu'r diffyg darpariaeth ohonynt. Felly, o feddwl ar raddfa weddol sylfaenol, dylai fod yn hawl sylfaenol i blant a phobl ifanc i dderbyn y gwasanaeth yna pan fo angen. Nawr bod gyda ni'r Mesur Hawliau Plant a Phobl Ifanc (Cymru) ar y llyfr statudol, pa wahaniaeth mae hyn yn mynd i'w wneud i'r ddarpariaeth o wasanaethau iechyd meddwl i blant a phobl ifanc sydd mewn aml i le yn ddiffygiol ar hyn o bryd?

[27] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Rydym wedi, wrth gwrs, doddi mwy o arian i mewn i CAMHS. Mae'n wir i ddweud ar y dechrau roedd llawer iawn o bobl ifanc wedi cael eu rhoi i CAMHS ac roedd yna broblem ynglŷn â'r amseroedd aros. Erbyn hyn, mae'r amseroedd hynny wedi dod lawr ac mae arian wedi mynd i mewn er mwyn delio â'r galw a oedd yna. So, mae hynny wedi digwydd. Mae yna gyllid, wrth gwrs, sydd yn cefnogi'r rhaglenni mwy eang, sef *Together for Children*, gyda'n gilydd i blant, a hefyd y rhaglen pobl ifanc. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth sydd yn cael ei arwain gan y gwasanaeth iechyd ei hun, ac mae honno yn rhaglen sydd yn gweithio gyda phartneriaid er mwyn edrych ym mha ffordd y dylai gwasanaethau gael eu gweithredu yn y pen draw. Cafodd y rhaglen honno ei dechrau yn 2015, a bydd hi'n rhedeg lan i fis Mawrth 2019.

children and young people, or the lack of provision of those services. So, if you think about that at a relatively fundamental level, there should be a fundamental right for children and young people to receive these services when necessary. Now that we have this Rights of Children and Young Persons (Wales) Measure on the statute book, what difference is that going to make to the provision of mental health services for children and young people, which are deficient in many places at the moment?

The First Minister: We have provided more funding for CAMHS. It's true to say that, at the beginning, very many young people were referred to CAMHS and there was a problem with waiting times. Now, those waiting times have been reduced and money has been provided in order to deal with the demand in that sector. So, that's already happened. There is funding, of course, to support the broader programmes, *Together for Children* and the young people's programme. That is something that is led by the health service itself, and that's a programme that works with partners in order to consider how services should be delivered ultimately. That programme was established in 2015, and it will run until March 2019.

10:15

[28] Wrth gwrs, fis diwethaf, fe wnaeth yr Ysgrifennydd Cabinet lansio rhaglen newydd er mwyn sicrhau bod y rheini a oedd yn gweithio yn CAMHS yn gallu dod i mewn i ysgolion er mwyn helpu ysgolion i roi gwasanaeth i bobl ifanc sydd ei eisiau, a hefyd i hyfforddi athrawon er mwyn eu bod nhw yn gallu ystyried problemau cyn eu bod yn mynd yn ormodol i bobl ifanc. Mae enghreifftiau yn fanna o beth sydd wedi digwydd ynglŷn â beth roeddem ni wedi moyn gwneud, a hefyd yr arian sydd wedi cael ei roi mewn i'r rhaglenni hyn.

Of course, just last month, the Cabinet Secretary launched a new programme in order to ensure that those working in CAMHS could actually go into schools to assist schools to provide services to those young people who need the services, and also to train teachers so that they can identify problems before they become too burdensome for young people. There are examples there of what has happened in terms of what we wanted to do, and the funding that's been provided for those programmes.

[29] **Dai Lloyd:** Rwy'n ymwybodol o'r amserlen dynn, Cadeirydd. Fe wnaef ei atal yn y fan yna.

Dai Lloyd: I'm aware of the tight timetable, Chair, so I'll leave it there.

[30] **Ann Jones:** Thank you very much. David, you've got a section that you wanted to talk about. You've got a question on this.

[31] **David J. Rowlands:** It's just coming back actually to your answer to some earlier questions with regard to the monitoring of public bodies and their implementation of the well-being of future generations Act. It seems that your answer was that they're all under a legal obligation to comply with the Act. Are you saying that there are no monitoring mechanisms in place with regard to that?

[32] **The First Minister:** Bear in mind, of course, we wouldn't monitor local authorities in that way. The local authorities have legal duties that they're obliged to observe. It will be a matter for the courts to monitor what they do if they're in breach of those legal duties. Of course, more generally, we do review legislation and its operation as a matter of course, but those public bodies are answerable to the courts if they fail to meet their obligations under the law.

[33] **David J. Rowlands:** Yes, but obviously, with regard to courts, that would be a long way down the line, wouldn't it, really? Things could have gone wrong and they could not have been compliant with this for quite some time. So, you're saying that the Welsh Government doesn't have mechanisms in order to monitor these.

[34] **The First Minister:** If we had concerns about any public body, we would raise those concerns with that body. If we felt that they were in danger of breaching the law, then we would tell them and we would work with them to make sure those breaches didn't occur. But, ultimately, any breaches of legal duties are monitored by the courts. It's not to say that we could leave them to it, clearly not, but the sanctions are applied by the courts. But in terms of avoiding those sanctions and getting things right, that is something that we would do, working with them.

[35] **Ann Jones:** Okay. More on the general issues there, before we move into more specifics on progress in implementing the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, and then moving into subject areas. You can follow up on the question by Dai Lloyd.

[36] **David Rees:** Thank you. To follow up on the question on mental health support, and I appreciate the work that's being done by the Welsh Government and the investment that's been put in, but, one of the concerns I've raised before is the ability to actually refer young people sometimes, and the challenges that face families and GPs in trying to refer people for support. Is the Welsh Government now looking at the position of widening the ability to refer young people for help? Because very often it's sometimes only schools, and then there's a problem because children can sometimes be seen to behave well in schools but actually have difficulties at home. There is a different approach required. Are you looking at the ability to widen the referral opportunities for people, so that a GP can refer rather than just perhaps a school counsellor?

[37] **The First Minister:** GPs can refer to CAMHS.

[38] **David Rees:** Well, they're not doing it very well.

[39] **The First Minister:** They're fully able to do it. I know examples where they have done that. So, there's no restriction on GPs referring young people to CAMHS where they feel it's appropriate.

[40] **David Rees:** I hope they can tell CAMHS that then, because CAMHS seem to be not accepting that all the time.

[41] **The First Minister:** I'm not aware of any individual cases. If that is the case, I'd like to know about it so I can investigate further.

[42] **Ann Jones:** Okay, thanks. Are we happy to move into more of the subject areas now on the UN monitoring? Lynne, do you want to start it off as Chair of the children's committee?

[43] **Lynne Neagle:** Yes. The UNCRC made some concluding observations to Welsh Government on which Welsh Government is meant to respond to the UN committee. Can you tell us whether there's a published action plan, which has been called for by both the UN committee and the children's commissioner?

[44] **The First Minister:** That is something that we are looking at. I'm not sure—. You mentioned the children's commissioner; the other call was made by who?

[45] **Lynne Neagle:** By the UN committee that monitors the implementation of the UNCRC.

[46] **The First Minister:** The UN's own committee.

[47] **Lynne Neagle:** Yes.

[48] **The First Minister:** That's a matter for the UK to respond to, as the state. I don't think the UK has responded to that at the moment.

[49] **Lynne Neagle:** But they also made recommendations to Welsh Government to publish an action plan for children.

[50] **The First Minister:** Yes, this is something that is still under consideration at the moment. We obviously take this seriously, as we took seriously the views of the Wales Observatory on Human Rights of Children and Young People when they looked at the children's rights impact assessment process to make sure that we can have a more streamlined and clearer process. But, the response to the UN would be a matter for the UK.

[51] **Lynne Neagle:** Right, okay. In terms of my committee's

responsibilities, obviously we very much welcome the consultation on the removal of the defence of reasonable chastisement, and to give equal protection to children and young people. Are you able to update us on where things are with that and when you expect legislation to make that a reality to be introduced?

[52] **The First Minister:** Yes, I can. We are still committed to moving this legislation forward. A campaign was launched on 2 October, which aims at asking parents, guardians and carers from across Wales to give us their views on parenting and discipline in order to inform the development of the legislative proposals. We will be formally consulting on legislative proposals early in the new year with a view to taking legislation forward.

[53] **Lynne Neagle:** Okay, thank you. A couple of Members have already raised concerns about child and adolescent mental health services, but the programme that covers CAMHS, Together for Children and Young People, is about much more than access to acute services; it's also about early intervention and universal support for children and young people to try and stop them ending up in the CAMHS system in the first place. One of the concerns has been that there maybe isn't enough partnership across Government, between health and education and the Cabinet Secretary for communities, to have everybody pulling together to deliver that programme. What assurances can you give that you, as First Minister, are taking a lead in ensuring that everybody in your Government is working together to make that programme deliver for children?

[54] **The First Minister:** It's absolutely right to say that we need to ensure that young people aren't identified in the system when they go to CAMHS, because they are in a position of presenting with acute symptoms at that point. So, the question then is: how do we prevent people getting to a point where they need CAMHS support?

[55] Two ways of doing that: the first is long embedded in our comprehensive schools—that is, there's a counsellor in every school. So, young people can go and talk to a counsellor. It's not always easy—I appreciate that—because young people can be reluctant to go and see somebody in case somebody else finds out. It's not going to happen, but that confidentiality is absolutely crucial, and I understand that. But beyond that, it's hugely important that teachers are able to identify what are low-level problems that may develop into something more serious.

[56] So, referring back to what I said earlier on, we have launched an initiative. The Cabinet Secretary launched an initiative on 25 September to embed CAMHS practitioners in schools. There are pilot projects in schools across Wales that run until the summer of 2020. The objective of that initiative is to help schools—to aid them—to identify early any problems that young people have, to identify the support that they might need, and also to upskill teachers, so that teachers are able to deal with low-level emotional issues such as exam stress, which might then develop into something else. It's quite right to say that being able to deal at an early stage with what might become a serious problem is crucial, and this is one example of what we're doing to deal with that.

[57] **Lynne Neagle:** Early intervention is absolutely critical, and I very much welcome the extra money. What role do you see, though, for the curriculum in ensuring that these issues around developing universal resilience are actually mainstreamed into the new curriculum when it comes in, so that all young people feel able to talk about these issues and get help when they need it?

[58] **The First Minister:** Well, the four purposes of the new curriculum are to: create ambitious, capable learners; enterprising creative contributors to society; healthy, confident individuals; and ethical, informed citizens. The third limb of that, of course—healthy, confident individuals—is hugely important. The new curriculum will seek to support young people in that way. What does that mean? Building up mental and emotional well-being, developing confidence, resilience and empathy. The education system is important in terms of getting qualifications, but, as we know, it's also important in terms of developing the individual and helping people to deal with life and what life can throw at you as you get older.

[59] Just one example of what that means in practice: at the moment, work is being taken forward to develop a design for the six areas of learning and experience, one of which is health and well-being. That will then look to develop a framework to put in place the ambition that we have. It's one thing to have an ambition, it's another thing to actually ensure that young people are able to be part of it. So, that work is ongoing, as to how we translate the ambition into something in practice when the new curriculum starts.

[60] **Lynne Neagle:** Okay, I've got one other question, but I don't know if Dai wants—it's not on CAMHS.

[61] **Ann Jones:** Do you want to come in on CAMHS then? Then I'll come back to you.

[62] **Dai Lloyd:** Diolch, Cadeirydd, a diolch hefyd i Lynne. Ar gefn beth roedd Lynne yn ei ddweud, bod angen cydlynu rhwng iechyd ac addysg, ac ar ben beth roedd David Rees wedi ei holi, y gwirionedd ydy, er y dylai fod yna bwyslais ar driniaeth gynnar a dal unrhyw fath o broblem yn gynnar yn lle ei bod hi'n datblygu i fod yn rhywbeth difrifol, mae hefyd angen pwysleisio bod cael problemau iechyd meddwl yn gyffredin iawn ac, yn sylfaenol, yn normal i blant a phobl ifanc hefyd. Mae'n rhaid i'n pobl ifanc ni sylweddoli hynny—o reidrwydd, nid oes dim byd mawr o'i le, achos mae'r teimladau hyn yn gallu bod yn hollol normal.

Dai Lloyd: Thank you, Chair, and thank you also to Lynne. Following on from what Lynne was saying about the need for co-ordination between health and education, and following on from what David Rees asked, the truth is that, even though there should be an emphasis on early treatment and identifying any issues early before they escalate, there's also a need to emphasise that having mental health issues is a very common thing and is normal for children and young people as well. Our young people have to realise that—that there's nothing majorly wrong, because these issues can be very common.

[63] Ond, o iddo fod yn broblem iddyn nhw a'u teuluoedd, rydym ni eisiau'r pwyslais yma ar driniaeth gynnar, ond beth sy'n digwydd ydy, fel roedd David wedi dweud, fod pobl yn mynd i weld eu meddyg teulu, ond nid yw'r seiciatryddion yn derbyn atgyfeiriad oddi wrth meddygon teulu heb iddyn nhw fynd yn ôl i'r ysgolion yn gyntaf a derbyn y cyngor yna. Dyna beth sy'n digwydd, achos nid yw'r capasiti yna i gael y driniaeth gynnar yna ar yr ochr iechyd. Mae'n rhaid arallgyfeirio ein pobl ifanc yn ôl i'r sector addysg.

But, in it being an issue for their families and for them, we want that early treatment. But as David said, what happens is that people go to their GPs, but the psychiatrists don't accept a referral from the GP without them going back to the school first and receiving that advice. That happens because the capacity isn't there for that early treatment on the health side. You have to direct our young people back to the education sector.

[64] Mae hynny'n broblem fawr i ni fel meddygon teulu, achos nid oes

That's a huge problem for us as GPs, because we don't have any powers to

gennym ni'r grym i arallgyfeirio i sector y tu allan i iechyd. Felly, dyna le mae meddygon teulu yn cael y syniad yma nad oes yna wasanaeth CAMHS, achos os nad yw'r broblem yn ddifrifol iawn, nid oes gwasanaeth, felly.

refer to a sector outwith the health sector. So, that's where GPs get this idea that there are no CAMHS services, because if the problem isn't very serious, there's no service available.

[65] Dyna sut mae'r cwestiynau hyn wedi dod. Ond, wrth gwrs, mae hynny'n golygu bod angen cael cydlynu manwl iawn rhwng iechyd ac addysg, felly, er bod iechyd yn dod o dan adran llywodraeth leol, ac, wrth gwrs, nid oes gennym ni'r grym i ddylanwadu, fel meddygon teulu, ar y system yna. Rydym ni'n hollol ddibynnol ar beth sy'n digwydd yn yr ysgolion, heb y grym i ddylanwadu mewn unrhyw ffordd. Wedyn, rydym ni'n teimlo ein bod ni'n colli'r grym neu'r pŵer i ddylanwadu ar iechyd y disgybl yna o'n blaenau ni.

That's why these questions have arisen. But that then means that we have to have very detailed co-ordination between education and health, even though health comes under the local government department, because we don't have the power to influence, as GPs, on that system. We're entirely dependent on what happens in the school, without the power to influence in any way what happens. So, we then feel disempowered to influence the health of that pupil before us.

[66] Felly, mae pwynt Lynne bod angen mwy o bwyslais ar gydlynu yn hollol gywir, achos dyna beth sydd ei angen. Mae'n rhaid inni gael y driniaeth gynnar yna, achos y pwysau sydd arnom ni fel meddygon ydy bod yn rhaid inni aros i'r plant yma fod yn ddifrifol wael er mwyn inni allu eu harallgyfeirio nhw yn syth i'r sector eilradd iechyd. Ond, nid ydw i eisiau aros i rywun ddod yn ddifrifol wael; buasai'n well gen i drin y broblem yn ei chamau cyntaf. Nid ydw i'n gwybod a oes gennych chi ryw sylw i'w wneud ar hynny.

So, Lynne's point that we need more emphasis on co-ordination is entirely correct, because that's what we need. We need this early treatment, because the pressure on us as GPs is that we have to wait for these children to become seriously ill before we can refer them directly to the secondary health sector. I don't want to wait for someone to become seriously ill; I want to treat the issue very early on. I don't know whether you have any comments to make on that.

[67] **Y Prif Weinidog:** A gaf i ofyn,

The First Minister: May I ask, if that

petasai'r unigolyn yn mynd yn ôl i'r ysgol a bod yr ysgol yn argymhell i'r unigolyn y dylai fynd yn ôl i'r meddyg teulu, a bod y meddyg teulu yn gwybod bod yr ysgol wedi argymhell hynny, a yw'n bosibl wedyn i'r meddyg teulu roi'r unigolyn ymlaen i CAMHS?

individual were to go back to school and the school recommended that the individual should go back to the GP, and the GP was aware that that was the recommendation made by the school, would it then be possible for the GP to refer the individual to CAMHS?

[68] **Dai Lloyd:** Rydym ni'n ysgrifennu llythyrau wedyn ar sail hynny. Ond hefyd, mae'r atgyfeiriad yn dod yn ôl, yn bownsio'n ôl, yn syth—yn ardal Abertawe, beth bynnag. Rydw i'n deall bod yna bwysau enfawr ar wasanaethau CAMHS, ond mae o yn broblem ac, yn amlwg, o brofiad David, nid jest yn ardal Abertawe. Nid ydw i eisiau gadael i bobl fynd yn ddifrifol wael cyn iddyn nhw gael eu gweld gan seiciatrydd, os oes rhaid.

Dai Lloyd: We write letters on that basis. But then the referral bounces back straight away—in the Swansea area, anyway. I understand that there are huge pressures on CAMHS services, but it is a problem, and it's clearly an issue in David Rees's area as well—it's not just Swansea. I don't want to wait for people to become seriously ill before they're seen by a psychiatrist, if that's needed.

[69] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Na, rwy'n deall hynny. Un o'r pethau y byddwn i'n gobeithio sydd yn digwydd yw bod y rheini sydd yn cynghori yn yr ysgolion yn ddigon parod i sicrhau bod yr unigolyn yn mynd yn ôl i'r meddyg teulu gyda rhyw fath o lythyr sydd yn cefnogi'r nod i'r person yna i symud ymlaen i CAMHS. Byddwn i'n gobeithio bod hynny'n digwydd yn weddol gyflym.

The First Minister: No, I fully understand that. One of the things I would hope happens is that those who provide advice in schools would be willing to ensure that those individuals do go back to their GPs with some sort of letter supporting that individual's referral to CAMHS. I'd hope that would happen relatively swiftly.

[70] Ond, i ddod yn ôl, wrth gwrs, i'r project peilot sydd yna ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n hollbwysig hefyd fod yna ffordd i sicrhau bod problemau'n cael eu delio â nhw pan maen nhw'n dechrau. Mae'n hollol wir i ddweud,

But, to return to the pilot project that's running at the moment. It's also crucially important that there is a means of ensuring that these problems are dealt with at the very early stages. It's entirely right to say

wrth gwrs, nad oes neb moyn eistedd yn ôl a dweud, 'Wel, mae'n rhaid i rywun fynd yn waeth cyn eu bod nhw'n cael unrhyw fath o driniaeth.' that nobody wants to sit back and say, 'Well, the individual has to become progressively worse before they get any treatment.'

[71] So, gyda'r cynghori sy'n cymryd lle yn yr ysgolion, byddwn i'n erfyn ar y bobl yna, os ydyn nhw'n gweld problem sydd angen unrhyw fath o ymyrraeth feddygol, i wneud hynny'n weddol gyflym. Nid oes rheswm pam na ddylai hynny ddigwydd, wrth gwrs. Yn ail, hoffwn i weld beth yw canlyniadau'r project peilot ynglŷn â pha mor effeithiol y mae wedi bod i ddelio â phroblemau cyn eu bod nhw'n mynd yn rhy wael. So, with the consultations happening in schools, I would expect those people, if they identify a problem that needs any medical intervention, to act relatively swiftly. There's no reason why that shouldn't be the case. Secondly, I want to see what the impact of the pilot project is in terms of dealing with problems before they escalate.

[72] **Ann Jones:** Lynne, your final question, then. Well, not your final question, but the final question in this set.

[73] **Lynne Neagle:** Just to return to the curriculum, some of the young people that I was speaking to earlier were telling me that they didn't feel that enough information was given to them on children's rights and the particular emphasis that we've got on that in Wales. Have you got any plans, with the new curriculum, to make children's rights education mandatory?

10:30

[74] **The First Minister:** Yes. We are working with the children's commissioner to see how that can be taken forward. It's hugely important that young people are aware of—it's not the most attractive way of putting it—the legal framework surrounding children's rights and what they are entitled to. So, that work is ongoing with the children's commissioner.

[75] **Lynne Neagle:** Thank you.

[76] **Ann Jones:** Okay. Dai, because you've already mentioned questions on it, do you want to take anything from the subject area of your committee, health and social care and sport? And then I'll go around.

[77] **Dai Lloyd:** Ie, ac fe wnaf i hefyd gwmpasu hynny gydag agenda'r pwyllgor newid hinsawdd, achos rydw i ar y pwyllgor hwnnw hefyd. Yn ymwneud efo iechyd ac iechyd y cyhoedd, yn nhermau symud ymlaen nawr o iechyd meddwl i iechyd penodol pobl ifanc—iechyd corfforol—a allwch chi ehangu ar y cynlluniau i leihau lefelau llygredd awyr, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gerllaw ysgolion ac ardaloedd preswyl pobl ifanc?

Dai Lloyd: Yes, and I'll align that with the agenda of the climate change committee, because I'm on that committee as well. This question is with regard to health and public health, in terms of moving on from mental health now to health issues facing young people in particular—physical health—could you expand on the plans to decrease air pollution levels, especially in areas surrounding schools and residential areas in which young people live?

[78] Mae yna waith yn mynd ymlaen, rydw i'n gwybod. Hefyd, mae yna angen codi ymwybyddiaeth ynglŷn â pheryglon llygredd awyr. Wedyn, jest ynglŷn â'r holl gwestiwn yma o hawliau, a'r hawl i iechyd cyhoedd glân, beth sy'n digwydd ym maes llygredd awyr?

There is work ongoing, I know. Also, we need to raise awareness about the dangers of air pollution. So, just with regard to this question of rights, and the right to clean public health, what's happening with regard to air pollution?

[79] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae canllawiau wedi cael eu rhoi i awdurdodau lleol ynglŷn ag ansawdd awyr yn eu hardaloedd nhw. Cafodd hynny ei gyhoeddi gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cabinet dros yr amgylchedd ym mis Mehefin. Nod y canllawiau hynny yw sicrhau bod rheoli ansawdd awyr yn cael ei wneud y tu mewn i Ddeddf cenedlaethau'r dyfodol. Dyma enghraifft lle mae hynny yn cael dylanwad ar beth mae awdurdodau lleol yn gorfod gwneud.

The First Minister: Guidance has been provided to local authorities on air quality in their areas. That was published by the Cabinet Secretary for the environment in June. The aim of that guidance is to ensure that air quality management is done in line with the well-being of future generations Act. That is another example of where that is having an impact on what local authorities are required to do.

[80] O dan y canllawiau, mae awdurdodau lleol yn gorfod ystyried yn arbennig y risg hirdymor i fabis ac i blant wrth ystyried faint o lygredd y

Under the guidance, local authorities do have to give consideration to the long-term risk to babies and children, as they consider the levels

maen nhw'n ei weld, os yw hynny yn of air pollution in their areas, eu tai nhw, yn yr ysgol, yn y whether that's in their homes, in feithrinfa, neu wrth gwrs wrth deithio their schools, nurseries, or in rhwng y ddau. Mae'r awdurdodau travelling to and from those lleol hefyd yn cael eu hybu i weithio locations. Local authorities are also gydag ysgolion er mwyn ystyried encouraged to work with schools in ffyrdd i leihau impact y *school run* yn order to consider ways and means of y bore—er mwyn, wrth gwrs, fod reducing the impact of the school hynny'n cael effaith bositif ar run, so that that can have a positive ansawdd awyr. impact on air quality.

[81] **Ann Jones:** John Griffiths.

[82] **John Griffiths:** Yes. In terms of those strategies on child health, Chair, one thing I think is undoubtedly very important is that we make sure that children are physically active and, indeed, that they develop those habits of being physically active early in life, particularly through schools, because nearly all young people are in school, so it's a prime opportunity. I just wonder, First Minister, whether you're content, in terms of the new curriculum, that physical education will have the prominence that's required to make sure that children do develop those good habits of exercise that will last them throughout their lives and ensure that they have better health throughout their lives.

[83] **The First Minister:** Absolutely. It's hugely important that the new curriculum encourages physical activity. We know that habits acquired and kept when people are young will improve their health as they get older, so it will be fundamentally important as part of the new curriculum.

[84] **Ann Jones:** David, you've got one on economy, infrastructure and skills.

[85] **David J. Rowlands:** Yes, with regard to the impact of business on children's rights, the UN committee calls for the implementation of regulations to ensure that the business sector, including in the context of public procurement, complies with the rights of the child. Are you happy that the regulations now in place under the Welsh Government are robust enough to make sure that they do comply?

[86] **The First Minister:** Yes, I am. I think that's fair to say. One of the issues that we look at, for example, as well as procurement—. Business

regulation isn't devolved, by and large. Procurement is under our control. One of the things we look at, of course, is procurement going back through the supply chain, not just the contract that was made with Government, in order to ensure, for example, that there are more apprenticeships available. We know how important apprenticeships are for young people, and we want to use our procurement power in order to encourage businesses to create apprenticeships through the contracts they have with Government.

[87] **David J. Rowlands:** Returning to my earlier theme of questioning, are you happy that there are mechanisms in place to monitor their compliance?

[88] **The First Minister:** Yes. That's done through the procurement process. We know that there's a duty on us to ensure that, when we conclude a contract with a contractor, we have to look at what's being done in terms of the sub-contracts to make sure that nothing is being done to the sub-contracting process that would cut across what we believe as a Government. So, we know we have a responsibility to look beyond the final contract, through the supply chain, in order to ensure that young people have those opportunities.

[89] **David J. Rowlands:** Thank you.

[90] **Ann Jones:** Huw, on constitutional and legislative affairs: do you want to take that section, and then I think I'll move into—?

[91] **Huw Irranca-Davies:** Thank you, Chair, yes. First Minister, just to return to Lynne's theme, but to take it into the area of legislation and constitutional affairs, the UN committee made several specific recommendations for Wales—not for the UK responsibility, but for Wales. If I can take you through the three that interest our committee particularly, one is that the UN committee recommended the Welsh Government should accelerate bringing domestic legislation in line with the UNCRC to ensure that principles and provisions are directly applicable under domestic law. Obviously, I won't need to tell you—you're very aware—of the importance of this, not least now as we move through negotiations on EU withdrawal as well. It probably heightens that.

[92] The second recommendation was the establishment of an inter-ministerial body such as a Cabinet sub-committee to co-ordinate all activities related to children's policy. The third is for the Children's Commissioner for Wales to be appointed by and accountable directly to the

National Assembly for Wales. Just to remind you, this was something that my predecessor committee, under the chairmanship of David Melding, brought forward a report on—that, actually, all commissioners should be accountable to, and appointed by, the Assembly of Wales rather than Welsh Government. So, I'd like to test your thinking on those three specific recommendations for Wales from the UN committee.

[93] **The First Minister:** Well, in terms of the appointment of the children's commissioner, I don't think it makes a difference to the independence of the commissioner; that's one thing I have to say. I think the commissioner is independent anyway. The fact that somebody appoints a commissioner—. In Scotland, judges are appointed by the First Minister. Nobody suggests that judges are in some way constrained because they are appointed by the First Minister, because, once they're appointed, they have that independence and objectivity that's needed.

[94] **Huw Irranca-Davies:** Do you think it makes a difference in terms of democratic accountability that they're not accountable directly to the Assembly?

[95] **The First Minister:** Well, they are accountable to the Assembly and its committees. I've never regarded the commissioners as being accountable to me for the recommendations that they make or the decisions that they take. They're wholly independent in that regard. Once I have taken a decision to appoint a commissioner, unless something is seriously wrong with the way that the office is operating, I don't see myself as having any role at all, or any business, actually, in interfering or influencing with any commissioner's decision. I don't think it's possible to pick out one commissioner more than the others. It's either all or none, and it's a debate, I'm sure, that will be taken forward over the next few years, but I don't think it makes a difference in terms of the independence of the commissioner.

[96] **Huw Irranca-Davies:** You don't have an in-principle objection to the recommendation from the UN committee, then.

[97] **The First Minister:** I'm willing to see how it would work, and look at how it would work. In principle—no, not an in-principle objection. But I think there are practical issues that would need to be taken forward. I do have to say I don't think it would make any difference in terms of the independence of the role.

[98] In terms of a Cabinet sub-committee, it's already a small Cabinet. The Welsh Cabinet is the size of Cabinet sub-committees in Whitehall. So, I'm not attracted to the idea of sub-committees. I've seen them operate before in Cabinet. There is a tendency, if you set up a sub-committee, for Ministers who are not on the sub-committee to tend to leave all that work to the sub-committee. That's not what I want to see. From my perspective, children's and young person's rights are a matter for the entire Cabinet, and I wouldn't want—you know, we talk about breaking down silos—to create a silo to put that matter into, another silo.

[99] The other issue was—

[100] **Huw Irranca-Davies:** To do with accelerating domestic legislation within Wales, because we have many of these areas that fall within devolved competence already—so, accelerating domestic legislation in line with the UNCRC to ensure those provisions are directly applicable under domestic law as opposed to applied or read across.

[101] **The First Minister:** This is complicated, in the sense that it would need to be stand-alone legislation that would be retrospective, potentially, as well. It is a hugely complicated area, not least because the Human Rights Act incorporated most of the European Convention on Human Rights into the law of the different jurisdictions of the UK, but there's established jurisprudence in human rights—courts have looked at human rights legislation for many, many years. Nobody has looked at the UNCRC. There's no established corpus of law and interpretation that deals with it. So, I don't underestimate the amount of work that would be required to introduce legislation of that kind. I think it would have to be done via stand-alone legislation. Bluntly, the legislative programme is very, very full, especially with Brexit coming. That said, it is hugely important that we incorporate as much of the convention rights as we can into legislation as legislation develops. At some point in the future, it might be that a Bill along those lines is required.

[102] **Ann Jones:** Okay. Thank you. I know you're itching to talk about external affairs, including Brexit, but that's David Rees's committee. I will bring David in, and, if you look at me nicely, you may get a supplementary. David.

[103] **David Rees:** Thank you, Chair; I'm sure he'll look at you nicely. First Minister, clearly the decision by the UK public to leave the EU last June, in 2016, is going to have a major impact upon young people in particular. In

the ‘Securing Wales’ Future’ White Paper with Plaid Cymru, you actually indicated that you would want to listen to the views of children and young people. In the nine months since the publication of that document, what’s the Welsh Government done to listen to the views of young people and children?

[104] **The First Minister:** Well, we have Young Wales, of course, which is the national participation forum for young people, which allows them to engage with Government and on decisions that affect them. We do fund Children in Wales to deliver Young Wales. The programme looks to reach out to young people in as many ways as possible, including, of course, in these days, social media, particularly, to reach out to young people who don’t want to come forward and have the confidence to do it, but whose views are nevertheless equally as important. Coming back to the statutory guidance that we’ve issued in the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015, that is also important because local authorities will need to adopt the national participation standards so that, at a local level, young people can have that voice as well. Also, of course, we have the youth parliament that’s being set up by the Assembly itself, which will enable young people to have a voice in that way. It’s not enough on its own, because a youth parliament will inevitably attract the more confident and the more articulate of young people. So, there has to be another way of making sure that people’s voices are heard as well, beyond a youth parliament.

[105] One of the things that the Treasury has done—the Welsh Treasury—is, if I remember rightly, to have two events asking young people about the budget as well. So, we are proactive in going out and looking to get the views of young people, whether it’s through stand-alone events, whether it’s through Young Wales, and, of course, in time, via the Assembly through the youth parliament.

[106] **David Rees:** Okay. So, there are starts of formal mechanisms in place, it sounds like, but, of course, we’ve often commented ourselves on the delays of the UK Government, and the time is going very quickly—and as Michel Barnier keeps reminding us, the clock is ticking—to March 2019. For us to actually ensure that young people’s views and positions are being reflected, there’s not a lot of time left to actually influence the negotiations at this point. So, are you stepping up a gear to engage with young people and children more?

[107] **The First Minister:** Well, I think I’ve outlined what we’re doing. I think

the reality is that it's difficult to know what kind of influence any of us can have in terms of the way things are changing as part of the Brexit negotiations. But, if we are serious about the well-being of future generations, then Brexit is perhaps the most important issue of all in the future. So, we have the mechanisms in place in order for young people to give their views. One of the things that I think is important is that nothing is done to reduce the rights of young people, or indeed people of all ages, in the future. The charter of fundamental rights, obviously, is an issue that will need to be looked at very carefully, whether the UK will continue to adopt that and whether there is the opportunity for Wales to adopt elements, at least, of that charter in the future. Nothing will stop us incorporating European law into devolved areas if we want to, once we leave the EU. It'll be a choice for the Welsh Government and for the National Assembly. When it comes to human rights, I don't think it's well understood in the public that the European Convention on Human Rights has nothing to do with the EU. Yes, you need to be a signatory to be part of the EU, but they're different bodies run by different organisations. I had people on the doorstep saying to me, 'Well, I don't like this European convention on human rights; that's why I'm voting for Brexit,' and I'd say, 'It's nothing to do with it. That's not the issue on the table.'

10:45

[108] The UK Government have said that they don't want to repeal the Human Rights Act 1998 while the Brexit process is ongoing. My argument would be that there's no need to repeal it at all, because I've had conversations in the past with working groups that have sought to look at a British bill of rights and, in fact, what they're coming up with is something identical, in reality, just taking the word 'European' out, because they don't like it.

[109] So, I think we have to be very mindful of the fact that the UK was absolutely crucial in developing the European convention on human rights in the first place. The UK drove it. For the UK to leave it would make the UK look—it would lose a great deal of respect in Europe and the world, and it's hugely important then that that Human Rights Act stays and, also, of course, that we remain signatories of the convention.

[110] **David Rees:** There's clearly a difference between the convention and the charter, and it's the EU charter we would probably lose as a consequence of leaving the EU. The withdrawal Bill—we've focused very much on the

attempt to take powers to Westminster when they should be coming, in our view, to Cardiff, or Edinburgh and Belfast. Has the Welsh Government looked carefully at the withdrawal Bill to see whether, actually, it would stop it doing anything to implement its own position on the EU charter in Wales?

[111] **The First Minister:** No, our interpretation is that there is nothing to stop us doing what we want in devolved areas, except through clause 11 and in other areas we are not able to alter areas that are seen as areas that were originally European. It doesn't mean we can't add those areas. What the current Bill says is—we obviously don't accept this position—that we would not be able to do anything legally that was previously the responsibility of the European Union. I won't interpret that as meaning that we couldn't actually add to that law. So, for example, when we leave the EU, if we're in a position where a particular directive is implemented, and it's in an area that is wholly devolved, I see no reason why we would not be able to incorporate that directive into our own law if we sought to do so.

[112] I think one of the things that's important to convey to people is that it's still possible to incorporate directives. It's a question then of those directives being voluntary, rather than compulsory. But it may well be, in some areas, that we would want to make sure that we change our own law in Wales in accordance with European law to make sure that it's easier for our businesses to export to the single market. There are all manner of possibilities that might exist in the future.

[113] **David Rees:** Okay. The UK Government, when it set up the referendum, decided not to listen to the voices of young people by not letting 16- and 17-year-olds vote on the situation. Have you had discussions with the UK Government relating to these issues to ensure that they are fully aware and they take these into consideration in the negotiations?

[114] **The First Minister:** I don't think they are aware, nor do they take these issues into consideration. As soon as it was agreed that 16- and 17-year-olds could vote in the Scottish referendum, the issue, to my mind, was resolved. If it's okay for one referendum, it's okay for all referendums, and, for that matter, it's okay for any election. You can't pick and choose the referendums that you allow 16 and 17-year-olds to vote in. I think it was the wrong decision not to allow 16 and 17-year-olds to vote in the Brexit referendum, given the fact they'd been allowed to do it in 2014, in the Scottish referendum. As a Government, of course, we're committed to reducing the voting age to 16, as far as future Assembly elections are

concerned, and I do think that there is no reason now why the voting age should not be lowered to 16. If it happened in one referendum in Scotland, there's no reason why it shouldn't happen in all elections.

[115] **David Rees:** Based upon this issue, which is clearly the departure from the EU and the implications it has, particularly the implications it has for young people, do you have confidence that the UK Government is considering these points when it puts its papers forward in its discussions for negotiation with the EU so that it will be in a position to actually ensure it addresses many of those points?

[116] **The First Minister:** I've seen no evidence of that.

[117] **David Rees:** Okay.

[118] **Ann Jones:** I had several people on a couple of issues back, so I've got John Griffiths and I've got Lynne, who want to come in, so you'll have to just wind it back to where you were. Sorry about this.

[119] **John Griffiths:** Talking to young people here today, First Minister, before our formal meeting started, as well as strongly supporting votes for 16-year-olds, there was a deal of concern in terms of withdrawal from the European Union on the effect it might have in limiting opportunities that young people have to study, to travel, to be part of exchanges for young people that benefit from European Union membership. Is there anything that Welsh Government might be able to do ensure that as many of those benefits as possible, and perhaps further benefits, are available to young people in Wales—benefits of that nature after EU withdrawal?

[120] **The First Minister:** Yes, we've got concerns about schemes like Erasmus, like Horizon—schemes that enable exchanges of people and views to take place across Europe. Nobody said in the referendum campaign that they wanted to restrict students' ability to study elsewhere. Nobody said in the referendum campaign that they wanted to stop people going on exchange visits. Clearly, those weren't the issues, and there's no reason why this shouldn't continue in the future.

[121] It's possible for the UK to remain part of many of those programmes without being part of the EU, and I think it's hugely important that the approach to Brexit is not one of, 'We must pull out of anything with the name "European" in it, because it's got the name "European" in it', because in that

case we won't be in the Euros in 2020 either. It has to be pragmatic. People voted to leave the EU. That we know, and that's what the referendum result was. What we don't know is what people's settled view is on how that should be done, and we still seem to be very divided on it. From my perspective, what I've always argued is that we should have the most sensible Brexit possible, and that means ensuring that our young people have the same opportunities as before. Surely we wouldn't want a situation where we were restricting the outlook and opportunities available to our young people.

[122] **Lynne Neagle:** I know when I've raised this with you before, you recognised that a lot of young people feel very angry that a decision was taken about their future that they didn't have any part in. I don't know whether it was you or Carl Sargeant who made the commitment to children in Wales that there would be a formal advisory committee of young people on Brexit, but you didn't make any reference to that in your earlier answer. Will there be an advisory committee on Brexit made up of young people?

[123] **The First Minister:** I see no reason why we shouldn't do that. We already have the existing mechanisms, but this is an important issue. I will consider how we can take that forward. You're absolutely right to say that many young people are very concerned about what Brexit might mean for them, and it does make sense for us to be able to have a mechanism where their views can be heard directly by Government.

[124] **Ann Jones:** Nick, you've got public accounts and finance. Is there anything you want to raise on those?

[125] **Nick Ramsay:** Yes, briefly: the UN committee's recommended that the Government intensify its efforts to give more support to parents and guardians. How is the Welsh Government looking to provide that support? Perhaps I could tie it in with the second question I was going to ask as well. The Public Accounts Committee in the Assembly is embarking on a major piece of work looking at the experiences of care-experienced children across Wales, and following through the issues that affect them from the moment they enter care to after-issues when they leave care, and providing support. So, clearly you will respond as a Government to the Public Accounts Committee's inquiry once we've done that, but if you could tell us how you're both looking overall at meeting the UN committee's request for more assistance for guardianship of children, both in the private sense and also in the corporate parenting sense.

[126] **The First Minister:** Well, first of all, we have the childcare offer that we're moving forward with, which will enable parents to look for work, enable them to raise their income levels, and that helps, of course, in terms of pulling people out of poverty. The childcare offer is a hugely important part of that.

[127] One of the areas that I've been particularly interested in is the area of looked-after children, corporate parenting. We can't pretend that looked-after children are doing, have done, well in the system over many years. We know there's an enormous gap in terms of academic achievement between looked-after children and the general population. We do have, of course, a ministerial advisory group driven—chaired, but driven as well—by David Melding, and that's been hugely important in bringing forward ideas as to how we provide the right level of support for looked-after children not just in the educational sense, but also in terms of stability, as too many of them move from one place to the next and back and forth, and that doesn't create a situation of stability for them.

[128] Now, £8 million has been allocated to accelerate the delivery of that group's programme. What does it mean? Expanding each local authority's services—'educare services', as they're called—so that families can access support early enough to avoid crises; rolling out the national fostering framework for Wales as well, and developing an all-Wales approach to adoption support. There are two issues here. First of all, strengthening the ability of local authorities to intervene early, so that families have the support they need when they need it and not when they're in crisis, and quite often in the situation where the crisis is insoluble.

[129] Secondly, in terms of children who've been adopted, for many years a child would be adopted and the parents just had to get on with it. We know that many, many adoptions break down when children become teenagers. Adverse childhood experiences are part of that. We know that there is a suggestion now that adopted children have those adverse experiences even before they're aware of them, when they're very, very young—influences of which they're not aware at the time, which influence them then as teenagers. So, we need to provide support for adoptive parents in those teenage years. Youngsters find that those are difficult years—I can just about remember them, but those are the years when young people need most support. Parents often need support, as adoptive parents, to deal with issues that they wouldn't be familiar with in their own family backgrounds. That, to me, is the way of providing the greatest level of support for those who need it the

most.

[130] **Nick Ramsay:** Do you think we need a more—? We often talk about co-production—it's one of those buzz words in the Assembly. Do you think that we need more of a co-productive approach with young people as well, when it comes to care experience? In the Public Accounts Committee, as part of framing our inquiry, we've spoken to young people about what issues are really affecting them in the care experience sector. So, do you think there's scope to actually include them much more? So, rather than just being looked after, they are actually telling us how they want to be cared for, both now and in the future when they leave care.

[131] **The First Minister:** You couldn't argue against that. That's hugely important. The system has tended to operate on the basis of—it's very paternalistic; I suppose, in a sense, it would be—what is deemed to be best for the child or young person. Well, a child or young person's view is not irrelevant, but tends to be disregarded until they reach a certain age. When I was a practitioner in the family courts, the family courts took the view that they didn't really take into account a child's views on where that child would want to live until they were at least eight years old, and probably older than that. Inevitably, a child would be placed with the parent who was deemed to offer them the greatest stability, and the child's view was not seen as important at that time. The older they got, the more that view was taken into account.

[132] Why eight years old? There's no particular reason for it. I don't see why we shouldn't be able to involve young people at a younger age, with the right level of support, to explain to them what options might be available and to help them to not take the decision themselves—that's too much to ask of a child that young—but for them to understand why decisions are taken and for them to have a view on a decision before it's taken. But, clearly, the system has tended to be geared towards providing for a child or young person, regardless of what that child or young person actually thinks themselves. That's got to change.

[133] **Ann Jones:** David, on this point.

[134] **David J. Rowlands:** First Minister, as a former justice of the peace, I knew that all the adult courts were open to the public. We understand that family courts are held in private and in secret. Do you have some concerns about that?

[135] **The First Minister:** No, I think it's appropriate. The only family proceedings that are held in public, if I remember rightly, is a contested divorce, of which I only ever saw one as they are exceptionally rare. I do think it's hugely important that children have their identities protected, and for that matter families as well, whether they are—. Let's take, for example, if adoption hearings were in public. Quite often, the birth parents don't agree to a child being adopted; quite often, they don't turn up in court, but they don't give their formal agreement; they would be able to identify the prospective adoptive parents. I can't think of a better way to put people off adoption than for that to happen. I have faith in the system that it's robust and fair. It doesn't have to be public. I think there are great dangers there.

[136] **David J. Rowlands:** Well, of course, you could have restrictions within those courts, but journalists could be allowed into those courts to make sure that they were being conducted in a fair and appropriate manner. They could have restrictions on their reporting. I've done that myself as a JP, restricted what journalists do and the names of people in the court. It's a great concern to me that these are still held in private.

[137] **The First Minister:** The higher courts are there to ensure fairness. If there's a procedural defect or a decision that is irrational, then of course the higher courts are able to step in and rectify that decision.

11:00

[138] My worry is—. I accept what you say about reporting restrictions—they are reserved—but I have seen instances where aggrieved birth parents have spent a lot of time trying to find the adoptive parents in a way that is not conciliatory. If they knew who the adoptive parents were, a lot of people would be put off adoption. They wouldn't want to have what they would see as a potential threat to them as a result of adopting.

[139] **Ann Jones:** Equality, local government and communities, John. I got the title right this time.

[140] **John Griffiths:** Thanks, Chair. First Minister, if we are to achieve the more equal and fairer Wales that we would, I think, all like to see, child poverty is an absolutely crucial issue. The UN committee urges the use of:

[141] 'clear accountability mechanisms for the eradication of child poverty,

including by re-establishing concrete targets with a set timeframe and measurable indicators'

[142] and continuation of regular monitoring and reporting on the reduction of child poverty. How do you react to that call in terms of Welsh Government strategy and performance management and evaluation?

[143] **The First Minister:** Well, I'd argue that we're doing it already. The national indicators underpin the well-being of future generations Act. They help us to measure our progress in a transparent way towards achieving the seven well-being goals. There are indicators there for relative poverty, material deprivation, levels of employment and healthy lifestyles, to give some examples. The first annual Well-being of Wales report was published last month. It provided data for the 46 national indicators and an analysis of progress against each of the seven well-being goals.

[144] This sounds very much as if I'm retreating into jargon here. What does this mean? We can measure what we're doing from one year to the next. That's hugely important. It's one thing to have an ambition, but unless you can measure in an open fashion how you're doing, then you can never be effective, and that's what the indicators are designed to do. A number of those indicators reflect the indicators in the child poverty strategy as well. For example, for those not in education, employment or training, children and young people achieving at level 2 is one of the indicators. So, we have the child poverty strategy with its indicators; they chime with the national indicators as part of the well-being of future generations Act, and that, then, provides us and the public with the ability to measure our progress.

[145] **John Griffiths:** Do you think there's enough clarity? We know, I think, that UK Government responsibilities and policies around taxation and the benefits system, for example, are very important in terms of tackling child poverty. We understand not all the levers are within Welsh Government control. Do you think there's enough clarity in Welsh Government strategy and enough accountability that clearly identifies what Welsh Government is able to do and how Welsh Government is performing against that responsibility?

[146] **The First Minister:** It's difficult because there are areas where we don't have all the levers. We can set ourselves targets, but it can be very difficult to have a target when you're not in control of the means to achieve that target. So, what we look to do is to have indicators that measure the progress that's

being made. In some areas, like child poverty, the levers will not all be with the Welsh Government. A change in the benefits system, a change to child tax credits, affects very significantly the level of child poverty, but I do think it's important that we are seen as having measurable indicators against which we and the public can measure progress.

[147] **John Griffiths:** Okay. If I could go on to a related issue, which is homelessness, First Minister, the UN committee also want to see:

[148] 'necessary measures to reduce homelessness and to progressively guarantee all children stable access to adequate housing'.

[149] I think we all understand the importance of that and how you need stable and adequate housing as a base to progress from and to go out from if you're really going to have the life chances and quality of life that most people, thankfully, take for granted. So, are you content, then, that Welsh Government strategy and policy around housing is strong enough to ensure that opportunity for all our children in Wales?

[150] **The First Minister:** Yes, and the Housing (Wales) Act 2014 has made sure that many thousands of people have not been made homeless. I think we should take pride in the fact that we have legislation that doesn't seek to deal with homelessness after it's happened but seeks to prevent it in the first place. I think I'm right in saying that over 80 per cent of cases of people who are at threat of homelessness had that homelessness prevented as a result of that legislation. There will be some, of course, who still become homeless. That's why we've given £2.6 million towards the homelessness support delivered via organisations who are on the ground, and which is why Supporting People is there for the next two years. I think it's hugely important just to make it clear that Supporting People will sit as a ring-fenced grant for the first year of the next financial year. Beyond that, it will still be there, but as part of a wider grant; it will not go into the RSG. That's not what the intention is. It will still be available to support people, but it'll be part of a wider and more flexible programme.

[151] **John Griffiths:** Given that it is part of that wider grant, then, First Minister, are we able to say, are you able to say, with confidence that the same amount of money will be available for Supporting People, which is so important to the tackling homelessness strategy and supporting people in housing—that same resource will be available even though it's part of that wider grant?

[152] **The First Minister:** Yes, it will. The amount of money isn't changing. That will remain; it's part of the budget agreement that we have. What we're looking to do is see how we can create a grant scheme that is even more effective, but the money is there and we know how important Supporting People has been as a programme, and it will be a hugely important part of what's developed in the second year. What we will not do is take the money, the £10 million for Supporting People, and put it into the RSG. We don't believe that will give us sufficient confidence that what is currently being done across Wales will be done consistently across all the local authorities.

[153] **Ann Jones:** Shall we move on to the programme for government as relevant to children and young people? There are a number of—. I think every Member will probably have some questions around this, but—. Huw, do you want to start?

[154] **Huw Irranca-Davies:** Yes, indeed.

[155] **Ann Jones:** You've touched on the votes at 16, but if you want to carry on—.

[156] **Huw Irranca-Davies:** Thank you, Chair. It's one specific question. We've mentioned the UK—. Sorry, the youth parliament, not the UK Parliament, which I used to have involvement with, but the youth parliament in Wales and its developing thought. Specifically for Welsh Government, for you as First Minister, and for your Cabinet Ministers, what will your involvement, engagement, interaction be with the youth parliament when it's up and running?

[157] **The First Minister:** Well, I think Ministers will be able to speak and take questions at the youth parliament. How frequently that will be is obviously a matter for examination further on down the line, but I would see myself as going there once a year in order to listen and in order to be able to take questions. I did it with Funky Dragon—not a name I was ever comfortable with, and I'm glad we now have a youth parliament that is what it says on the tin—but, yes, it's important that youth parliament isn't just able to deliberate itself, but also is able to have access to Ministers from time to time as well.

[158] **Huw Irranca-Davies:** Are you expecting that the youth parliament will—I hope—say some quite different things from a different collection of people? And if it says things that are difficult and awkward and challenging

for Government, should we expect that you and your Cabinet respond to those difficult challenges?

[159] **The First Minister:** I think so. Why have a youth parliament if it just agrees with what the Assembly says? Young people would soon get disillusioned if what they were suggesting wasn't answered. We're not going to agree on everything, obviously, and there'll be some issues that won't be possible—. Some things won't be possible to deliver, but questions deserve an answer, and I think it's important the youth parliament is able to do that.

[160] **Huw Irranca-Davies:** One final short question, Chair, and it's to do with the fact that devolution doesn't stop at Cardiff in terms of our Assembly, and, in a sense, neither should it with the youth parliament either. We have, for example, in our area in Bridgend, a very strong youth council, but that's not the case across all parts of Wales. So, what role should we be seeing, going forward, for the youth councils—strengthening those youth councils across Wales and for them feeding into the youth parliament as well?

[161] **The First Minister:** Well, the statutory guidance that I referred to at the start of this session requires local authorities to support, and I quote,

[162] 'a County Youth Forum/Council as a representative body of young people to act as a channel for young people's views across their local authority and represent those views to local and national decision-making bodies.'

[163] So, the statutory guidance makes it clear that there should be a youth forum or council in every council area in Wales.

[164] **Huw Irranca-Davies:** Okay.

[165] **Ann Jones:** Lynne.

[166] **Lynne Neagle:** Can you provide an update, First Minister, on the 2015 programme for children and young people, and specifically how it relates to 'Taking Wales Forward' and the new strategy, 'Prosperity for All'?

[167] **The First Minister:** Yes. Karen, can I ask you just to come in on this one?

[168] **Ms Cornish:** Yes. I think what we can say is that, obviously, children and young people have a really high priority in ‘Taking Wales Forward’ and ‘Prosperity for All’, the national strategy. We are not intending to have a separate action plan, and elements from the 2015 programme that you would expect to see within ‘Prosperity for All’ and ‘Taking Wales Forward’ are certainly well reflected, whether that’s early intervention and prevention, parenting, those sorts of things, they are all there.

[169] **Lynne Neagle:** So—

[170] **The First Minister:** Sorry, early years is one of the five priorities, of course, in ‘Prosperity for All’.

[171] **Lynne Neagle:** So, what role did due regard and the CRIA process play, both in developing the programme for government and also ‘Prosperity for All’? Was there a CRIA for those?

[172] **Ms Cornish:** There was an integrated assessment, as you would expect, which includes looking at children’s issues and children’s rights.

[173] **Ann Jones:** Okay.

[174] **Lynne Neagle:** Yes.

[175] **Ann Jones:** Dai, *mentrau iaith*.

[176] **Dai Lloyd:** Reit, symud ymlaen i raglen y Llywodraeth ynglŷn â'r bwriad i gael miliwn o siaradwyr Cymraeg erbyn y flwyddyn 2050, yn naturiol, mae yna gryn drafodaeth wedi bod ym mhob man. Yn benodol, o sgysiau rydym ni wedi eu cael eisoes y bore yma—rwyf i wedi cyfeirio atyn nhw eisoes—efo disgyblion Ysgol Gyfun Gwynllyw, yn bendant, yma yng Ngwent, mae yna her ynglŷn â darpariaeth mentrau iaith. Wrth gwrs, rydw i'n ymwybodol bod canolfannau mentrau iaith yn llewyrchus mewn sawl lle, ond maen

Dai Lloyd: Right, so, moving on to the programme for government with regard to the intention to have a million Welsh speakers by the year 2050, naturally, there’s been a great deal of debate about this in all parts. Specifically, from the discussions that we’ve had already this morning—I’ve referred to them already—with pupils from Ysgol Gyfun Gwynllyw, here in Gwent, there is certainly a challenge with regard to the provision of *mentrau iaith*. I’m aware that *mentrau iaith* centres are flourishing in several areas, but that depends

nhw'n dibynnu yn rhannol ar arian cyhoeddus a hefyd yn rhannol ar frwdfrydedd lleol, buaswn i'n ei ddweud. Ond, wrth gwrs, mae darpariaeth menter iaith yn allweddol bwysig i gael adloniant a gweithgaredd pobl ifainc tu fas i'r ysgol. Oni bai am hynny, mae'r iaith Gymraeg yn cael ei chysylltu yn unig â'r ysgol. Roedd yn arfer bod yr ysgol a'r capel, ond, y dyddiau hyn, yr ysgol yn unig yw. Felly, rydym ni'n trio ehangu hynny er mwyn, wrth gwrs, cynyddu'r niferoedd. So, buaswn i'n licio rhyw fath o syniad ar hynny.

[177] Hefyd, mae problem ymarferol sydd yn digwydd y dyddiau yma o bobl yn derbyn addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg ond, wrth gwrs, nid yw'r ddarpariaeth ysgrifenedig, dywedwch pan ydych chi'n astudio addysg grefyddol i lefel A, yna, hyd yn oed mewn ysgol cyfrwng Gymraeg, yn y Gymraeg. Mae'r ddarpariaeth ddim ond yn Saesneg. Nawr, rydw i'n gweld bod honno'n sefyllfa hollol annerbyniol, mae'n rhaid i mi ddweud.

[178] Hefyd, pan fo'r cwricwlwm yn newid mewn rhai meysydd eraill, megis y gwyddorau, megis ffiseg, er enghraifft, weithiau nid yw'r ddarpariaeth yna yn y Gymraeg yn cyrraedd mewn pryd. Felly, mae yna angen wedyn—hyd yn oed pan ych chi'n dysgu ffiseg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, mae'r ddarpariaeth ysgrifenedig a'r gefnogaeth yn

partly on public funding and partly, of course, on the enthusiasm locally, I would say. But, of course, the provision of *mentrau iaith* is essential for entertainment and activities for young people outside of school. Otherwise, the Welsh language is wholly connected with the school. It used to be the school and chapel, but, nowadays, it is just the school. So, we want to try to expand that in order to increase the number of Welsh speakers. So, I'd like some idea about that.

And there's a practical issue that happens these days with people receiving Welsh-medium education, but, of course, the written provision, say when you're studying religious education, for example, at A-level, isn't available, even in a Welsh-medium school, in Welsh. The provision is only in English. I see that as a totally unacceptable situation, I must say.

Also, when the curriculum changes in some other areas, such as the sciences, such as physics, sometimes the provision in the Welsh language doesn't arrive in time. So, even when you're studying physics through the medium of Welsh, the written provision and the support are in English only, which can also confuse people. Now, we have Welsh-medium

digwydd yn Saesneg yn unig, sydd hefyd yn gallu drysu pobl. Nawr, mae gyda ni ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg am reswm, hynny yw, darparu addysg trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ond hefyd wrth gwrs, yn naturiol, rydych chi'n gallu siarad Saesneg, ond hefyd mae'r Gymraeg a'r Saesneg yn gyfartal y dyddiau hyn yn gyfreithiol. Felly, buaswn i'n licio'ch sylwadau chi ar yr anallu, weithiau, i gael addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg mewn rhai meysydd penodol. Diolch yn fawr.

[179] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hwn yn dechrau gyda'r blynyddoedd cynnar, yn fy marn i, ac rydym ni'n gwybod—wel, mae'n dechrau cyn hynny, yn dechrau gyda'r cylchoedd meithrin. Rŷm ni'n gwybod bod yna fwy o alw am gylchoedd meithrin ar draws Cymru ac rŷm ni wedi ymrwymo i gynyddu'r nifer o gylchoedd o 150 dros y ddegawd nesaf. Mae yna her, er enghraifft, ynglŷn â'r cynnig gofal plant, i sicrhau bod yna ddigon o ddarpariaeth ar gael, yn enwedig yn y de-ddwyrain. Rŷm ni'n awyddus am hynny, ac rŷm ni'n gwybod, wrth gwrs, ei fod e'n un peth i ddweud ein bod ni'n mynd i gael mwy o gylchoedd meithrin, ond mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau bod y gweithlu yna hefyd er mwyn eu bod nhw'n gallu cael eu staffio. Nawr, mae hwnnw'n waith sydd yn cael ei wneud ar hyn o bryd.

[180] Ynglŷn â'r ysgolion uwchradd, mae gyda ni gynlluniau, wrth gwrs, sydd yn rhoi help i bobl sydd eisiau dysgu rhai pynciau drwy gyfrwng y

schools for a reason, that is, to provide education through the medium of Welsh, but also, of course, you can speak English, but English and Welsh have parity legally these days. So, I'd like your opinion on the inability, sometimes, to have Welsh-medium education in some specific areas. Thank you very much.

The First Minister: This starts in the early years, in my view. It starts even before that, with the *cylchoedd meithrin*. We know that there is more demand for *cylchoedd meithrin* across Wales, and we are committed to increasing the number by 150 over the next decade. There is a challenge, for example, in terms of the childcare offer in ensuring that there is sufficient provision available, particularly in the south-east. We are eager to see that is put in place, and we know it's one thing to say that we want to have more *cylchoedd meithrin*, but we also have to ensure that the workforce is in place so that they can be properly staffed. That is work that is ongoing.

Now, in terms of the secondary schools, we do have plans in place that do assist people who want to learn certain subjects through the

Gymraeg. Mae gwyddoniaeth wastad wedi bod yn her, rydym ni'n gwybod hynny, ac rydym ni'n moyn sicrhau bod yna fwy o athrawon ffiseg, cemeg a bioleg ar gael, er mwyn bod yna ddarpariaeth yn yr ysgolion Cymraeg i wneud hynny.

medium of Welsh. Science has always been a challenge, we are aware of that, and we do want to ensure that there are more teachers of physics, chemistry and biology available in order to ensure that there is provision within the Welsh-medium schools to provide that education.

11:15

[181] Mae ysgolion yn rhedeg eu hunain trwy reoli ysgolion yn lleol, ac mae dyletswyddau ar yr awdurdod lleol, ond rydym ni'n gwybod bod yna ddyletswydd arnom ni, er mwyn cynyddu nifer y bobl sy'n gallu dysgu pwnc yn Gymraeg ac sydd gyda'r hyder i wneud hynny. Achos, fel mae Dai yn gwybod, mae sut cymaint o bobl sydd yn siarad Cymraeg, ond a fyddai'n dweud, 'Wel, na, smo fy Nghymraeg i'n ddigon da' i ddysgu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae gloywi Cymraeg, felly, yn rhywbeth hollbwysig, a bod yna gyrsiau ar gael i helpu pobl i wneud hynny.

Now, schools run themselves through local management of schools, and there are duties upon local authorities too, but we also know that there is a duty on us as a Government to ensure that there is an increase in the number of pupils who can learn subjects through the medium of Welsh and have the confidence to do that, because we know that there are so many Welsh speakers who say, 'Well, my Welsh isn't good enough' to study through the medium of Welsh. So, improving Welsh-language skills is crucially important, and we must ensure that there are courses available to help people to do that.

[182] Yr her fwyaf yn fy marn i yw: ym mha ffordd ydym ni'n sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn enwedig yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg tu fas i'r ysgol, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd lle nad yw'r Gymraeg yn iaith gymunedol? Mae fe'n her mewn ardaloedd lle mae Cymraeg yn iaith gymunedol erbyn hyn, ac rwyf wedi gweld hynny fy hunan. Ym mha ffordd ydym ni'n helpu i ddatrys hynny? Mae'r mentrau

The greatest challenge, in my view, is: how do we ensure that young people particularly use the Welsh language outwith the school walls, particularly in those areas where the Welsh language isn't the community language? It is a challenge, even in those areas where Welsh is the community language. I've seen that with my own eyes. Now, how do we resolve that problem? The *mentrau*

iaith yn hollbwysig. Rŷm ni wedi, wrth gwrs, rhoi arian i sawl adeilad ar draws Cymru, adeiladau diwylliannol, lle mae'r Gymraeg yn cael ei defnyddio mewn ffordd hollol naturiol. Mae un ym Mhontardawe, er enghraifft, un yng Nghaerdydd, un ym Mangor, un yn Llanelli, a sawl un arall ar draws Cymru. Mae fe'n bwysig bod pobl yn gallu mynd i rywle lle nad yw'n cael ei ystyried fel rhywbeth od i siarad Cymraeg, er mwyn iddyn nhw allu ymarfer eu Cymraeg nhw. Os nad ydyn nhw'n ymarfer, felly, maen nhw'n colli'r iaith.

[183] Mae'r Urdd yn allweddol hefyd, ac rwy'n gwybod bod gan yr Urdd Bwrdd Syr IfanC, sef bwrdd o bobl ifanc sy'n cynghori cyngor yr Urdd ynglŷn â beth ddylai gael ei gynnis i bobl ifanc yn y Gymraeg. Mae'n un peth i bobl sydd ddim mor ifanc â hynny i ddweud, 'Wel, dyna beth sydd ar gael', ond mae'n beth arall, wrth gwrs, i bobl ifanc ddweud yn gymwys beth maen nhw eisiau ei weld.

[184] Allwn ni ddim cyrraedd y targed o filiwn heb fwy o ddarpariaeth Cymraeg mewn ysgolion, a heb golli'r bobl hynny unwaith maen nhw'n gadael yr ysgol. Mae yna bwyslais, yn iawn, wedi bod am flynyddoedd ar addysg Cymraeg, ond dim digon o bwyslais, efallai, blynyddoedd yn ôl ynglŷn â sut i gadw'r bobl hynny, a hefyd, wrth gwrs, eu bod nhw'n meddwl eu bod

iaith are crucially important. We have provided funding for a number of premises across Wales, cultural centres where the Welsh language is the natural language of communication. There's one in Pontardawe, one in Cardiff, one in Bangor, one in Llanelli, and a number of others across Wales too. It is important that people can go somewhere where it's not seen as odd to speak Welsh, so that they can practice their Welsh, because, if they don't use the language, they will lose it.

The Urdd is also crucially important, and I know that the Urdd has Bwrdd Syr IfanC, which is a board of young people that advises the Urdd council as to what should be provided for young people through the medium of Welsh. It's one thing for people who aren't so young to say, 'Well, that's what's available', but it's an entirely different thing for young people to say exactly what they want to be made available.

Now, if we're to reach the target of a million, we can't do that without more Welsh-medium provision in schools. We also need to ensure that we don't lose those people once they leave school. Quite rightly, there's been an emphasis on Welsh-medium education over the years, but perhaps not enough emphasis years ago on how you retain those people and give them the confidence to use

nhw'n gallu defnyddio'r Gymraeg yn the Welsh language, ultimately.
y pen draw.

[185] Fel un sy'n dod o deulu lle As someone who comes from a
mae pawb yn siarad Cymraeg, wel, family where everyone spoke Welsh,
felly, roedd yn rhywbeth hollol well, it was entirely natural for me,
naturiol i mi, er taw ym Mhen-y-bont although I was brought up in
cefais i fy nghodi. Roeddem ni'n Bridgend. I spoke Welsh at home,
siarad Cymraeg yn y tŷ, er i ysgol although I went to an English-
Saesneg es i. Roedd yn hollol naturiol medium school. It was entirely
i siarad Cymraeg gyda phobl a oedd natural for me to communicate in
yn siarad Cymraeg. Ond, wrth gwrs, Welsh with those who spoke Welsh.
mae profiad sut cymaint o bobl eraill But, of course, so many people have
yn wahanol, sef: yr unig Gymraeg a different experience: the only Welsh
roedden nhw'n ei chlywed oedd yn yr that many people heard was in
ysgol, ac unwaith roedd y safle school, and, once they left school,
hwnnw wedi'i gollu iddyn nhw, nid there was no opportunity for them to
oedd yna gyfle iddyn nhw siarad use the language after that. Those
Cymraeg ar ôl hynny. Dyna'r bobl are the people that we have to keep
mae'n rhaid i ni ddal arnynt er mwyn hold of in order to attain that target.
cyrraedd y targed.

[186] **Dai Lloyd:** Ie, wel, diolch am **Dai Lloyd:** Well, yes, thank you very
hynny. Yr union brofiad â finnu: much for that. You had the same
mae pawb yn fy nheulu i yn siarad experience as I did: everybody in my
Cymraeg, ond i ysgolion gyfrwng family speaks Welsh, but I went to an
Saesneg es i hefyd, achos roedd yna English-medium school because
ddiffyg darpariaeth ar y pryd, achos there was that lack of provision at the
ein bod ni mor hen. Rwy'n falch o time, because we're so old. But I'm
weld yr holl ysgolion Cymraeg yma very pleased to see all these Welsh-
yn blodeuo dros y lle i gyd. medium schools flourishing across
Wales.

[187] Ond roedd y cwestiwn yn But the question with regard to
benodol: lle mae gyda chi ysgolion Welsh-medium schools specifically
Cymraeg rŵan, ac mae gyda chi now, and you have teachers teaching
athrawon yn dysgu trwy gyfrwng y through the medium of Welsh in
Gymraeg yn y pynciau hynny, mae those subjects, is the lack of material
diffyg deunydd yn y Gymraeg ar gael, in the Welsh language, for example,
fel yn addysg grefyddol. Nid yw'r with religious education. The
llyfrau ac ati a'r gefnogaeth textbooks and the IT support aren't

gyfrifiadurol ar gael yn Gymraeg, dim ond yn y Saesneg, er bod athrawon ar gael. Yr un peth, pan fyddech chi'n newid y cwricwlwm yn ffiseg, ac ati, ac weithiau yng nghemeg, hefyd, o fy nghof—mae'n rhaid newid, ond mae yna *lag*, mae yna oedi, cyn bod y deunydd Cymraeg ar gael yn ein hysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg ni gydag athrawon eisoes yn dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Dyna ydy'r her.

available. They're only available in English, although there are Welsh-medium teachers available. The same happens when you change the curriculum in physics and so on, and sometimes in chemistry, from memory. There is a lag before the Welsh-medium materials are available in our Welsh-medium schools with teachers who are already able to teach through the medium of Welsh. That's the challenge.

[188] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Dyletswydd, mewn ffordd, CBAC yw hwn. Nhw sy'n gyfrifol am gyhoeddi'r llyfrau sydd yn cefnogi cwricwlwm y pwnc. Fel rhywun—rwy'n mynd i gyfaddef hwn nawr—sydd wedi mynd i safle'r we ac wedi edrych ar beth sydd ar gael fel adnoddau i bobl ifanc sy'n astudio trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, mae yna rai pynciau lle mae'r llyfrau yna, ond mae pynciau eraill—ac mae addysg grefyddol yn un ohonyn nhw—TGAU, lle nad oes yna ddim llyfr yn Gymraeg sydd yn cefnogi'r pwnc. Mae un yn dod, ond mae hwnnw'n dod, os cofiaf i, ym mis Mawrth y flwyddyn nesaf. So, mae yna her hefyd i'r cydbwyllgor sicrhau bod yr adnoddau ar gael er mwyn cefnogi'r pwnc, yn enwedig pan fo'r cwricwlwm yn newid.

The First Minister: Well, that's the responsibility of the WJEC, in a way. They're responsible for publishing the textbook support in the subject curriculum. Now, as one—I'm going to confess this now—who's gone to the website and looked at what's available as resources for young people studying through the medium of Welsh, there are certain subjects where the textbooks are already in place, but there are others—and RE is one of them—at GCSE where there is no textbook through the medium of Welsh to support the subject. It's on its way; I think it's going to be available in March of next year. So, it is a challenge for the WJEC to ensure that the resources are available in order to support subjects, particularly when the curriculum changes.

[189] Beth ddylai digwydd, wrth gwrs, yw, os yw'r cwricwlwm yn newid, felly, dylai'r adnoddau fod yna unwaith i'r cwricwlwm newid. Ond

What should happen, of course, is that, if the curriculum changes, then the resources should be in place once that change is made. But that's not

nid felly y mae ym mhob pwnc ar hyn always the case with every subject at
o bryd. the moment.

[190] **Ann Jones:** Lynne, you've got a few questions.

[191] **Lynne Neagle:** Thank you. First Minister, we're sat here today in the Cwmbran Centre for Young People, and I am incredibly proud of the work that they do supporting young people here. The Welsh Government has previously committed to ensure that we have universal open access youth provision across Wales, but I can tell you that centres like this, because of austerity and the pressure on local government, are existing hand to mouth. What plans do you have to ensure that that commitment to universal open access youth provision is a reality in Wales?

[192] **The First Minister:** Well, we will encourage local authorities, of course, to provide that provision. We provide funding for local authorities through the revenue support grant. Many local authorities—and we have an example here in Cwmbran—are able to support young people's centres. It's not something we'd want to fund directly. It's hugely important that local communities are able to determine what kind of provision should be made for young people. But, clearly, we would be very concerned if we saw centres across Wales being closed and young people finding they've got nothing to do.

[193] **Lynne Neagle:** Okay. This centre gets very little funding, actually, off the local authority. They're constantly having to apply for grants. One of the things that was recommended to Welsh Government, mindful of the reluctance to hypothecate funding, was that Welsh Government develop an outcomes framework that actually ensures that local authorities do deliver, across Wales, that level of provision. Is that something that you can discuss with the Minister responsible, to try and make that a reality?

[194] **The First Minister:** Yes, I can. In many ways, that chimes with the well-being of future generations Act again, and the responsibilities that local authorities have. We encourage local authorities to create the participative frameworks via youth councils, but of course it's hugely important that, alongside that, there are facilities available. I don't underestimate the challenges of local authorities—I know. We face austerity every year on an annual basis, and local authorities are no different in that regard. But, it is something I'll discuss with the Minister. Perhaps if I write to the committee with more information on that in terms of our thinking.

[195] **Ann Jones:** That would be very helpful.

[196] **Lynne Neagle:** I just had another question then on transport, which again is an issue that's come up in the discussions with young people. I'm obviously very mindful that older people in Wales get free bus travel, while young people who are having to trek about Gwent and other areas on public transport are having to find the money. One young woman that I spoke to earlier is spending £20 a day going on the train to Hereford. Can you provide an update on plans to introduce a genuine concessionary travel scheme for young people that will really make a difference?

[197] **Ann Jones:** I've got a couple of Members—I think it's on transport—before you come back. John, and then David, and then—. Is it on transport?

[198] **David J. Rowlands:** This is not on transport.

[199] **Ann Jones:** Yours isn't on transport.

[200] **David J. Rowlands:** No.

[201] **Ann Jones:** On transport, John?

[202] **John Griffiths:** Yes, it's the same point as Lynne's. We've had this debate about intergenerational justice and fairness. It's often said that because older people tend to vote in greater numbers, they get more concentration and more focus from Governments, and policies are meeting the needs that they have and offering them benefits. We talked about votes at 16 earlier, which hopefully might change that balance a little bit, but I just think that what Lynne is talking about is a good example of that. There's free travel for over-60s, but there isn't free travel for younger people, and it is having a real impact on their incomes and the money that they have to spend otherwise.

[203] **The First Minister:** In terms of the trains, the discounts are the same for young people and older people via the railcards. It's a third off for both, if I remember rightly. But, in terms of buses, a consultation was launched on 10 October on introducing a discounted bus scheme for young people. Obviously, the aim is to capture the views of young people, schools and colleges—as wide as possible. What we want to do is to obtain views about a range of possible enhancements to the current young persons discounted

bus travel scheme, including perhaps increasing the age limit to 24 in the future. We would look to introduce the new scheme in April next year, and we want that scheme to reflect the views of young people coming through the consultation.

[204] **John Griffiths:** Just to say, Chair, all the younger people here today can take part in that consultation and make their views known.

[205] **The First Minister:** Yes, the more the merrier. The question is how. They can answer the question about how we do it. Perhaps, at the end of this session, it might be useful for some of our people here to liaise and give them the opportunity to find out how they do that.

[206] **Ann Jones:** Yes, that's fine, I'm sure we'll be able to provide you with the website or even how to write and do your consultations. That would be very handy. David, you've got a question.

[207] **David J. Rowlands:** Yes. The young people we spoke to this morning voiced their frustrations at the fact that they are finding great difficulty in securing work experience. I know, through the Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee, we've heard evidence in evidence sessions that this is a universal problem. Given the fact that we now have moves within the Welsh Government and the education department towards apprenticeships and vocational skills, should this not be a priority area for the relevant Welsh Government departments to look into this and to make sure that there are adequate abilities out there for the students to access work experience?

[208] **The First Minister:** I think there are three issues there. First of all, with work experience, it's the responsibility of the educational institution to arrange that. I don't say that's easy, but it's for them to work with local businesses to provide those opportunities for young people.

[209] On the issue of apprenticeships, one of the issues I think that does need to be borne down on is the issue of internships—unpaid internships—which pretend to be work-experience schemes, but are in fact long-term schemes where people give up their time and don't get paid for it. I think there has been a tendency in some organisations to offer internships that are not paid. The BBC, actually, is one organisation where there are a number of unpaid internships where there might be questions as to why it's done that way. I mean, people want to get that work experience in the BBC, but we must be careful that it doesn't cross the line into what seems to be long-

term, unpaid work.

[210] Apprenticeships are hugely important, we know that. We have an ambition, of course, to create 100,000 apprenticeships across Wales—all ages—because we know that people have to retrain many times in the course of their lives. But, if we look at schemes such as Jobs Growth Wales—hugely successful—if I remember rightly, 17,000 young people were offered opportunities of apprenticeships that then led to jobs, with an 80 per cent success rate.

[211] We know that if you work with businesses and ask businesses, ‘Look, what do you need?’, as we did with Jobs Growth Wales, then they’ll say—. What we found with Jobs Growth Wales is that a lot of small businesses were saying, ‘We’d like to take someone on. We can’t afford to train them. There is a job for them. So, you, Government, the best help you could give us would be to provide us with the funds to train that person so that we can then take them on.’ That’s exactly how the scheme worked, and it worked very well, and that meant that many young people had opportunities that otherwise they wouldn’t have.

[212] **David J. Rowlands:** I just want to scrutinise you just a little bit on the fact that you said it’s the educational departments that have the duty to put these work experience situations in place. They’re saying there are issues such as insurance and—I know, from when I took some work experience people in—health and safety. I had one come in to work in the kitchen of a business I had, and he wasn’t allowed to touch hot water, touch knives, or in any way get involved, so he was standing around. Now, that’s health and safety, we know that, but it’s all frustrating this ability for young people to have work experience.

[213] **The First Minister:** Yes, it’s not much work experience if people stand around and watch.

[214] **David J. Rowlands:** No, absolutely, that’s right.

[215] **The First Minister:** I take the point. The issues that have been referred to there are not issues that are devolved. What would be interesting to me is if I was able to hear examples of difficulties that not just schools and colleges, but individuals have faced in trying to gain work experience. My son is going to need to get work experience in February, so I’ll soon see how easy that is for the school involved. I’ve not heard evidence that this is a

widespread problem, but if that is the case, I'd like to hear more about it to see what we might be able to do as a Government in order to help to alleviate the situation.

[216] **Ann Jones:** I think, First Minister, that there is sufficient evidence from the work that we've done and the outreach work that was done previously. We can provide you with some examples in our follow-up letter to you, to enable you to have a wider picture of the problems young people are facing. Certainly, I think most of us as Assembly Members have offered to assist with that, but if we're going to come up against issues of insurance, health and safety, and other issues, then it's about safeguarding those young people as well. So, we'll provide you with the evidence, hopefully—

[217] **The First Minister:** That would be really useful.

[218] **Ann Jones:** —and then get a response back and then feed it back out to people, if that's okay. If everybody's happy, I'm going to close this part of the session and say thank you very much for that. We're going to move—. There's a couple of issues you're going to provide further information on and we'll provide information to you on the main substance of that.

11:30

Sesiwn i Graffu ar Waith y Gweinidog—Materion Amserol Ministerial Scrutiny Session—Topical Matters

[219] **Ann Jones:** I'm now going to move to item 3 on the agenda, which is topical issues. I've been notified of two, but I'm reluctant to say I've only been notified of two, because I know what will happen, you'll all find some. We know we're time specific on this. Huw, you've got the first topical question, and then I'll be coming to Dai Lloyd after.

[220] **Huw Irranca-Davies:** Thank you, Chair. First Minister, we've already discussed in the earlier session the important relationships between the higher education sector in Wales and the UK and other European nations, regardless of the issues around Brexit. But, I'm wondering if he has any concerns over the teaching of European-related matters within Wales's higher education sector and whether he's considered it necessary to write out to the universities to see what's on the curriculum, who's teaching it, and what they're saying.

[221] **The First Minister:** I have not felt the need to do that. I very much defend the academic freedom of universities and I do not think universities have to—well, not just justify what they teach, but to provide a list of names of the people who teach those courses. That, for me, was the most sinister part of that request.

[222] **Ann Jones:** Okay, thank you. That was very good. Dai Lloyd.

[223] **Dai Lloyd:** Diolch, Cadeirydd. **Dai Lloyd:** Thank you very much, Beth roeddwn i eisiau ei godi oedd Chair. The issue that I wanted to bod yna adolygiad allan rŵan am raise was that there's a review now of ddyfodol uwch ganolfannau trawma the future of major trauma centres in yn ne Cymru—*major trauma south Wales*, and you will be aware centres—ac mi fyddwch chi'n that there's already been a review ymwybodol bod yna adolygiad eisoes undertaken. There's a consultation wedi mynd allan. Mae yna now and the local community health ymgynghori rŵan ac fe fydd y councils will consult on that. The cynghorau iechyd cymuned lleol yn intention is that there will be—. ymgyngori ac ati. Wrth gwrs, y There is currently one trauma centre bwriad ydy—. Mae yna un ganolfan in Swansea and one in Cardiff. The trawma ar hyn o bryd yn Abertawe ac aim and the decision of this review is un arall yng Nghaerdydd. Wrth gwrs, to have one in south Wales, and that bwriad a phenderfyniad yr adolygiad one centre will be located in Cardiff. yma ydy cael un yn ne Cymru, a bydd yr un honno yng Nghaerdydd.

[224] Yn naturiol, mae hyn wedi codi Now, this has caused a great deal of gwrychyn pawb yn y gorllewin, nid concern in the west, not just in jest yn Abertawe, ond hefyd yn Swansea, but also in Aberavon, Aberafan, Castell-nedd, sir Neath, Carmarthenshire, Ceredigion, Gaerfyrddin, Ceredigion, de south Gwynedd, Montgomeryshire, Gwynedd, sir Drefaldwyn, sir Benfro—Pembrokeshire—these areas that do y llefydd yma sydd, yn naturiol, yn refer people to the specialist services tynnu pobl at y gweithgareddau offered in the tertiary centre in arbenigol yma sy'n digwydd yn y Morryston Hospital. Morryston is ganolfan drydyddol, sef Ysbyty facing the loss of one of its tertiary Treforys. Mae Treforys yn wynebu, services, namely trauma. felly, colli un o'i gwasanaethau trydyddol, sef trawma.

[225] Mi fyddwch chi'n ymwybodol You'll be aware of the history, in the

o'r hanes, wrth gwrs, yn y gorffennol, pan mae yna adolygiad wedi bod. Bymtheg mlynedd yn ôl, roedd yna adolygiad i ddyfodol niwrolawdriniaeth pediatrig. Roedd yna ddwy ganolfan yn y de, ac un oedd i fod. Roedd y dewis rhwng Treforys a Chaerdydd. Caerdydd a gafodd ei dewis, er bod yr unig *paediatric neurosurgeon* ar y pryd yn Abertawe. Nid oedd hynny'n ddigon cryf i gadw'r ganolfan yn Abertawe. Symudwyd hi i Gaerdydd.

[226] Rhyw 10 mlynedd yn ôl, roedd yr un un math o ymgynghoriad ar niwrolawdriniaeth. Dwy ganolfan yn y de, Abertawe a Chaerdydd, un oedd i fod, ac, *hey presto*, mynd i Gaerdydd. Nawr, rydym ni'n wynebu'r un math o beth. Hefyd, yn y dyfodol agos, bydd yna ymgynghoriad arall allan ar lawdriniaeth y frest—*thoracic surgery*. Mae yna ddwy ganolfan yn y de, Treforys a Chaerdydd, ac rydym ni'n disgwyl yn eiddgar am ganlyniad yr adolygiad yna.

[227] Ond, wrth gwrs, mae yna ddau berygl yn y fan hyn. Hynny yw, mae Abertawe, Treforys, eisoes yn ganolfan arbenigol drydyddol efo nifer fawr o driniaethau arbenigol, sydd yn ymdrin â'r rhan fwyaf o ddaeyryddiaeth Cymru—y canolbarth a rhannau o'r gogledd. Wrth gwrs, mae yna bethau arbenigol wedi datblygu hefyd yn Abertawe yn sgil y *city deal*—yr ysgol feddygol newydd ac ati. Ac wrth gwrs, pan mae yna

past, when a review has been undertaken. Fifteen years ago, there was a review of the future of paediatric neurosurgery. There were two centres in the south and there was meant to be one. The choice was between Morriston and Cardiff. Cardiff was chosen, despite the fact that the only paediatric neurosurgeon was located in Swansea. That wasn't a strong enough case to keep the centre in Swansea. It moved to Cardiff.

Some 10 years ago, there was the same kind of consultation on neurosurgery. There were two centres in the south, one in Swansea and one in Cardiff, there was meant to be just one, and, hey presto, it moved to Cardiff. Now, we're facing the same kind of issue again. Also, in the near future, there'll be another consultation on thoracic surgery. There are two centres in the south, one in Morriston, one in Cardiff, and we're eagerly expecting the result of that consultation.

But, there are two dangers here. Morriston in Swansea is already a specialist tertiary centre with a great deal of specialist treatments undertaken, covering most of the geography of Wales—mid Wales and parts of north Wales. There are specialist services that have developed in Swansea following the city deal—the new medical school, and so on. And of course, when there is another review—. So, the one

adolygiad arall—. So, yr un pwynt ydy tanseilio Abertawe, peryglu hynny neu beth bynnag, fel canolfan arbenigol.

[228] Yr ail bwynt ydy, o ganoli popeth yng Nghaerdydd, pan fyddwch chi'n cael adolygiad arall ar raddfa Brydeinig, mae hi wastad yn gystadleuaeth rhwng Caerdydd a Bryste, ac fel rheol, Bryste sy'n tueddu i ennill y gystadleuaeth honno. Rydym ni wedi gweld hynny efo llawdriniaeth y galon i blant rhai blynyddoedd yn ôl—*paediatric cardiac surgery*. Roedd yna ddewis rhwng Caerdydd a Bryste; mi aeth o i Fryste, er ym Mryste roedd y problemau wedi dechrau, fel rydych chi'n cofio—y sgandal marwolaethau plant nôl ym 1998. Felly, yr ail berygl—nid jest perygl i Abertawe ynglŷn â dyfodol trydyddol, ond hefyd y perygl i Gymru o golli pob gwasanaeth, neu'r rhan fwyaf ohonyn nhw, os ydy wastad yn dod lawr i gystadleuaeth rhwng Caerdydd a Bryste.

[229] Y pwynt olaf ydy bod yna 27 *major trauma centre* yn Lloegr ar hyn o bryd. Un fydd nawr yng Nghymru. Ac wrth gwrs, rydym ni'n mynd i gael adolygiad arall yn y dyfodol, sy'n mynd i ddweud bod 28 o *major trauma centres* yn ormod, 'Beth am gael dwsin?' Felly, bydd yna gystadleuaeth rhwng Caerdydd a Bryste, a disgwylwn ni i weld lle bydd y penderfyniad.

point is that it undermines Swansea, endangers that or whatever, as a specialist centre.

The second point is, if you centralise everything in Cardiff, when you have another British review, it's always a competition between Cardiff and Bristol, and as a rule, Bristol tends to win in that particular competition. We've seen that with heart surgery for children a few years ago—paediatric cardiac surgery. There was a choice between Cardiff and Bristol; it went to Bristol, despite the fact that the problems started in Bristol, as you will remember—the child death scandal back in 1998. So, the second danger—it's not just a risk for Swansea and the future of tertiary services, but it's a risk for Wales losing all its services, or the majority of them, if it always comes down to a competition between Cardiff and Bristol.

My final point is that there are 27 major trauma centres in England at present. There'll be one in Wales. And of course, we're going to have another review in future that's going to say that 28 trauma centres is too many, 'Why don't we have a dozen?' And then there will be another competition between Cardiff and Bristol, and we'll await the result of that decision.

[230] **Y Prif Weinidog:** Wel, yn gyntaf, nid oes barn gan y Llywodraeth ar hyn o bryd ar hwn. Mae hwn yn rhywbeth i'r byrddau iechyd ei drafod. Os nad ydyn nhw'n cytuno, wrth gwrs, fe fydd yna rôl wedyn i Weinidogion Cymru. Mae pawb yn gytûn taw un ganolfan a ddylai fod. Beth sydd ddim, wrth gwrs, wedi cael ei gytuno yw ym mhle y dylai'r ganolfan honno fod. Mae yna adolygiad wedi cymryd lle. Mae hwnnw nawr yn nwylo'r byrddau iechyd. Mae lan iddyn nhw nawr i sicrhau beth yw'r ffordd ymlaen i fod.

[231] Ynglŷn â chystadleuaeth rhwng Bryste a Chaerdydd, er enghraifft, wel, nawr, wrth gwrs, mae yna Lywodraeth gyda ni. Gallaf i roi un enghraifft lle y byddai gwasanaeth wedi mynd yn hollol i Loegr yn y gorffennol, a honno wrth gwrs yw beth fydd yn cael ei ddarparu gan y ganolfan isranbarthol ar gyfer gofal dwys i'r newydd-anedig yng Nglan Clwyd. Yn nyddiau'r Swyddfa Gymreig, byddai'r gwasanaethau hynny i gyd wedi mynd i Alder Hey. Fe gymerais i'r penderfyniad, ar ôl adolygiad, y dylai'r gwasanaethau hynny gael eu cynnal yng Nghymru. Roedd modd i wneud hynny mewn ffordd saff—roedd hynny'n hollbwysig—ac felly, wrth gwrs, mae'r SuRNICC yn cael ei adeiladu ar hyn o bryd yng Nglan Clwyd. Felly, un peth y gallaf ei ddweud gyda hyder, a buaswn i'n hoffi siarad am Lywodraethau i ddod hefyd, byddai neb o blaid rhoi lan canolfan drawma

The First Minister: Well, first of all, the Government hasn't taken a view on this. This is something for the health boards to discuss. If they can't agree on an outcome, of course, there will be a role for Welsh Ministers at that point. Everyone is agreed that there should be one centre. What hasn't been agreed is where that centre should be. A review has now taken place that's now in the hands of the health boards, and it's up to them to decide on the way forward.

In terms of competition between Cardiff and Bristol, for example, well, now, we have a Government. I can give you one example where a service would have gone entirely to England in the past, and that example of course is what's to be provided by the sub-regional neonatal intensive care centre at Glan Clwyd. During the days of the Welsh Office, all of those services would have gone immediately to Alder Hey. I took the decision, following a review, that those services should be provided in Wales. It was possible to do that in a safe manner—and that's crucially important, of course—and we now do have that SuRNICC, which is currently being built at Glan Clwyd. So, one thing I can say with confidence, and I hope I can speak on behalf of future Governments too, that nobody would be in favour of giving up a major trauma centre in Wales, wherever that centre may be based.

yng Nghymru, ble bynnag fydd y ganolfan hynny yn mynd.

[232] **Ann Jones:** David, on this point.

[233] **David Rees:** On this point and another point, if that's okay.

[234] **Ann Jones:** On this point first, and then I might come back to you in a minute.

[235] **David Rees:** They're both on health. On the major trauma centre decision, it's interesting that they're talking about making the decision based upon neurosurgery services at Cardiff, which means, therefore, the loss of the service back—however many years ago—has now influenced the decision on the major trauma centre. I would hate to see a situation where the major trauma centre influences a decision on other services and we see a continued diminution of services at Morriston in that sense. But linking into that—and I'll put the other question into that—today, actually, your Government has issued a statement saying that the consultation on the boundary changes for ABMU is going to start shortly. It's going to have a major impact in my position on my constituents, because my constituents actually share the services between the two sides of ABMU, east and west. But, what impact would that have upon Morriston and the major trauma centre as well? Because, again, services will be under pressure as a consequence of that. There will be fewer resources, possibly, going into Morriston because funding will be reduced as a consequence of that. In the consultation process, will you be making sure that the details of what will be on offer and how that will be funded are clear? Because people need to have confidence that their health service is going to be delivering the care they want and will not suffer as a consequence of one local authority wanting to go east rather than west.

[236] **The First Minister:** I have to be careful here, because this directly affects my own constituency, so I will not be part of the decision-making process in the future. We do need to make sure, of course, that we have as much consistency as possible in the regional footprints across Wales, and of course there's a consultation out to see what that means for the county borough of Bridgend and its future relationship with the health boards. I don't think I can go any further without expressing a view as the consultation is ongoing, and it wouldn't be right for me to say so in this capacity as First Minister.

[237] **David Rees:** Well, can I ask, in the capacity of First Minister, will you ensure your Government ensures there's sufficient detail as to how the funding arrangements will be put in place and how the service arrangements will be put in place, as part of that consultation, so that people can see that?

[238] **The First Minister:** I will impress upon the Cabinet Secretary the need to be as transparent as possible, without getting involved in the decision-making process.

[239] **Ann Jones:** Right. Nick. You're—. On health. Loosely—

[240] **Nick Ramsay:** It's on health, but locally. We're just down the road, here, from the site of the new critical care centre, the Llanfrechfa hospital that Lynne Neagle and I have been asking questions about for as long as I can remember—Lynne longer than me. Can you give us an update on where we are with that? Are we still looking at a 2021 opening date, I think it was?

[241] **The First Minister:** Yes, we are.

[242] **Nick Ramsay:** Thank you.

[243] **Ann Jones:** John.

[244] **John Griffiths:** We're going through the Welsh Government, the Assembly's, budget process at the moment, First Minister, and I think most people will be aware that health is taking a bigger and bigger share of the overall budget, and I think people will understand the pressures that create that. But nonetheless, health is determined—good health or indeed ill health—by a wide range of factors, and local authorities are responsible for a lot of service delivery that very directly impacts on health, I guess most obviously with social care, but also things like leisure services, community development, youth services. I wonder if you could tell us a little bit about how Welsh Government is recognising the importance of local government in the round, but also in terms of ensuring good health, and to what extent Welsh Government is working with local authorities and the Welsh Local Government Association to understand the pressures that they face, and to help them find new, better models of delivery around leisure services, around community development, for example.

[245] **The First Minister:** The key is collaboration. I've said it many, many

times: I don't believe that our local authorities are able to deliver consistently in many areas because, quite often, it's an issue of size; it's an issue of the critical mass within departments. There are two ways of dealing with that: one is reorganisation. We've been there. The other one is collaboration that is mandatory and not voluntary. We've tried that before, and it doesn't work. My worry is always that we always have one department—at least one department—in one local authority that isn't performing. At the moment, of course, we have the warning notices being issued to Powys. At one point we had six local authorities in special measures for education. We had one local authority that collapsed so fundamentally we had to take it over, in Anglesey. Well, that's not a sustainable footprint for local authorities in the future. That said, we have a good example of the way that local authorities have collaborated in terms of education provision, and we've seen the difference. It's been much better over the last few years in terms of provision, in terms of results, and local authorities can take credit for the collaborative work that they have put forward.

[246] Regional working is crucial. Morriston Hospital have told me in the past that they work with seven different social services departments and all have slightly different ways of working. Well, that's not really a good way of ensuring seamless provision of health and social care. We need to make sure that there's much more seamlessness across local authority boundaries, that there's much more regional delivery of services. I get the impression that in some departments in some of the smaller local authorities, they lose two or three people, perhaps if they're on the sick, and they're starting to struggle in a way that Mid Glamorgan didn't, that Gwent didn't, because they had the critical mass that was needed. So, that regional model of working that is mandatory is absolutely crucial to ensuring success in the future, whilst local authorities, of course, are able to maintain their identities and local people are able to elect local authorities for their own area.

[247] **Ann Jones:** Okay. Because I'm in a particularly good mood, because it is the start of half term next week, you can have a final question, Mr Rees.

[248] **David Rees:** Thank you, Chair. We talked about Brexit this morning, and very much the impact upon young people and children, but clearly nationally there were some major concerns happening this week, particularly when David Davis, the Secretary of State, seemed to give an indication that there will be no vote in Parliament possibly until after the exit date, if we know the exit date. The Prime Minister seems to give a different message. Have you had discussions with the UK Government and the Prime Minister to

say whether the Welsh Government and the Welsh Assembly would actually have any say on any final deal?

[249] **The First Minister:** Well, I've always made the point that any deal should be ratified by the—hopefully at that point—four parliaments. I think that gives it far more robustness than would otherwise be the case. There are issues that are not devolved that will affect us greatly in the future, particularly with regard to trade. A free trade agreement with New Zealand can only be bad for Wales. There's nothing that we can gain from it, but our farmers can lose an awful lot from it. I think the greatest danger that the UK faces—and the chances of it are probably slim. I think that we'll end up with something in terms of a deal with the EU. I think the chances of 'no deal' are fairly slim, but there is still that possibility that we come out of the EU without a trade deal with anyone, in which case our manufacturers have open access to Britain, which is far too small for them to be able to prosper.

[250] I was saying to people that Britain is smaller than Vietnam. It's half the size of Japan. It's not a big market in terms of numbers. Historically, Britain's economy has grown on trade with other countries. It is absolutely crucial that we are able to get a good deal in terms of access, for Welsh business, to a market that is much bigger than the States, on our doorstep, and already has a great deal of regulatory convergence. The rules are the same anyway. So, if we can't conclude an agreement with the European market, doing it with other markets where rules are very different, where regulations are very different, that's going to take us six or seven years.

[251] I've spoken to people who have been involved in trade negotiations and they all say the same to me: it takes about six or seven years to conclude a trade deal. When Greenland left the EU, it took some years for the deal to be done, even though it was mainly around fish and not much else. So, these things are never as easy as they look. I've seen the list of WTO tariffs and the amounts of those tariffs, and it is so detailed that there are tariffs on hats and umbrellas. It's a vast list and the tariffs vary. There's a different tariff on smoked fish compared to fresh fish. It's incredibly complicated. So, the emphasis to me shouldn't be on, 'Let's try and get a trade deal with the States in a year'—that's never going to happen; it's, 'Let's focus on getting the best deal possible with our biggest market that's on our doorstep.'

11:45

[252] **David Rees:** On the issue of trade deals, the trade White Paper and the

customs White Paper have been published and they involve the comment that they will consult with the devolved administrations, and I think one says devolved legislatures, which is the Assembly. But, I can consult with people and ignore the consultation. Have they indicated they will listen and act? Are they actually going to be involving you or are they just simply paying lip service to it?

[253] **The First Minister:** I think that if it's perceived over many years that the UK Government is not listening to the legislatures of Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland, there are challenges there for the UK, challenges that I don't want to see emerge. So, it's hugely important that consultation is meaningful. Where there are serious concerns, such as—our farmers will say, quite rightly, 'What is the use of a trade deal with New Zealand? It's a market of 4 million.' New Zealand lamb is not a direct competitor to Welsh lamb, it operates in different markets, but if restrictions were taken off the import of New Zealand lamb into the UK, there is a direct effect on Welsh farmers. Take that together with 'no deal', with a 40 per cent tariff on Welsh lamb going into its main market, which is Europe, and sheep farming gets wiped out. Not all farming. Dairy farming wouldn't get affected in the same way.

[254] There's no need for this. This can be resolved. It's not as if this is inevitable. But I am not supportive of free trade deals for the sake of it. It depends which country it's with and it depends on the relative income levels. Free trade deals work best when they're conducted with markets where there is a similar wage rate. Otherwise, you end up exporting your jobs into a cheaper market, which is what drove a lot of the discontent in the American presidential elections last year: people saw jobs going to Mexico, where wage rates were lower. I remember when the accession countries from eastern Europe came into the EU, some factories did move into Hungary and Poland because wages were lower, but they were the sorts of businesses that would just move on to somewhere else in time. So, free trade agreements are not the panacea that people think they are if they're done with the wrong countries and with the wrong markets. Do it in the wrong way, and you just export jobs.

[255] **Ann Jones:** Thank you very much. I'm going to draw it to a close there and say thank you very much to the First Minister for coming in, and thank you to Members and to those in the public gallery for listening. I hope you found it useful.

[256] At this point, I want to say thank you to the centre for allowing us to

come here and use your venue, and for your patience and your co-operation. As you'll have noticed, we don't travel lightly at all. So, it's particular thanks to Leila Long and David Schofield and all the team—I don't know where they are, somewhere around—and the management committee as well for their help in organising the practicalities for this meeting to take place.

[257] Thank you, First Minister, for coming along. We'll send you a draft, but we'll also write to you with some of the points that we said we would raise with you, and look forward to having your points back from there. I understand that your office has indicated that you have a couple of minutes now to have a photograph with some of the children.

[258] **The First Minister:** I do.

[259] **Ann Jones:** So, we'll arrange that now.

11:49

**Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd
o'r Cyfarfod
Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public
from the Meeting**

Cynnig:

Motion:

bod y pwyllgor yn penderfynu that the committee resolves to gwahardd y cyhoedd o weddill y exclude the public from the cyfarfod yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog remainder of the meeting in 17.42.

accordance with Standing Order 17.42.

Cynigiwyd y cynnig.

Motion moved.

[260] **Ann Jones:** But, before we do that, can I just ask that the motion under Standing Order 17.42 to resolve to exclude the public from the rest of the meeting—for us to have a private session—is accepted? Okay, thank you very much. So, if that's okay then, we'll set some photographs up. We can reconvene at 12.00 p.m. if that's all right. Thank you. Thank you very much.

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion agreed.

Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 11:49.

The public part of the meeting ended at 11:49.